

***NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS  
CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING  
Wednesday, June 25, 2008, 9:00 am-4:15 pm  
ONMS Pacific Islands Region Conference Room  
Hawaii Kai, Hawaii***

Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES

Advisory Council Members: Bill Gilmartin (Research); Gail Grabowsky (Education); ‘Aulani Wilhelm (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHI CRER)); William Aila (Native Hawaiian); Don Schug (Research); Linda Paul (Conservation); David Laist (Marine Mammal Commission for Lloyd Lowry); Barbara Maxfield (Fish and Wildlife Service for Susan White); Laura Thompson (Conservation); Kem Lowry (Citizen-At-Large); Eric Roberts (US Coast Guard for CDR Mark Young); Athline Clark (State of Hawaii for Tim Johns); Jarad Makiau (WESPAC for Kitty Simonds); Cindy Hunter (Research); Louis “Buzzy” Agard (Native Hawaiian); Naomi McIntosh (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS));

*Absent:* Alexandra Curtis (U.S. Department of State); Philip Taylor (National Science Foundation); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); CDR Mark Young (U.S. Coast Guard); Kitty Simonds (Western Pacific Fishery Management Council (WPFMC); Jessica Wooley (Conservation); Lloyd Lowry (Marine Mammal Commission); Tim Johns (State of Hawaii); Susan White (US, Fish and Wildlife Service); Mike Tosatto (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), National Marine Fisheries (NMFS)); Becky Hommon (U.S. Navy); Bobby Gomes (Commercial Fishing); Carlos Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Matthew Zimmerman (Ocean-Related Tourism)

Alternate Council Members (not representing voting members): Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian); Isabella Abbott (Native Hawaiian);

[NWHI CRER Staff]: Hoku Johnson; Keeley Belva; Brady Phillips;

[Monument Staff]: Cori Kane (State of Hawaii); Doug Runde (State of Hawaii); Jeff Pollack (NOAA OLE);

[Members of the Public]: Marti Townsend (KAHEA); Issac Harp (‘Ilioulaokalani Coalition); Melva Aila; Stephanie Fried; Dave Raney (Sierra Club); Keiko Bonk (MCBI); Miwa Tamanaha (KAHEA); Bryna Storch (KAHEA); Laura St. Denis (Chaminade student);

PURPOSES OF THE MEETING:

- 1) Review and discuss Draft Monument Management Plan consolidated comment sheet
- 2) Finalize Reserve Advisory Council comments on Draft Monument Management Plan

## I. CALL TO ORDER (PAUL)

Council Vice Chair Linda Paul called the meeting to order and Council Secretary William Aila offered a pule to begin the meeting.

## II. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (PAUL)

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Paul reviewed the agenda for the day.

## III. REPORTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE DRAFT MONUMENT MANAGEMENT PLAN FROM RAC WORKING GROUPS & SUBCOMMITTEES

1. Summary of Comments from Public Meetings—Aulani Wilhelm provided an update for the group of comments that the staff compiled at the public meetings. Frequent topics included bio-prospecting, education and outreach, budget, enforcement, research, permits, human impacts and threats, public involvement and advisory councils, Midway Atoll, Native Hawaiian access, and military. She explained that this was only what the staff compiled, not part of the official record, which will be addressed in the final Monument Management Plan.
2. Native Hawaiian Cultural Working Group Meeting—The Monument NHCWG met on June 20-21 and William Aila provided an update to the RAC. The group developed three main recommendations for the RAC to consider. They supported a public advisory committee for the Monument, they felt that the Native Hawaiian community should be represented in a fourth co-trustee seat for the Monument, but in the interim OHA should represent that seat, and finally they agreed that the Monument should identify and restore access to Native Hawaiian families that can demonstrate a history of conducting traditional and customary practices in the NWHI, especially for families on Kauai and Niihau, and add language to the DMMP to address this. There was discussion on how to further document who has family connections to the NWHI.
3. Enforcement Update—The Vice Chair asked for an update from the US Coast Guard and NOAA Office of Law Enforcement representatives about ongoing investigations and violations that have occurred in the Monument. Ms. Wilhelm mentioned that there are three violations that are pending. The group discussed the investigation process for enforcement cases.
4. RAC Comments on the Monument Management Plan Vision, Mission, Guiding Principles, and Goals —Ms. Paul handed out a summary of comments that the RAC members provided. There was discussion on the Vision, Mission, Guiding Principles, and Goals statements in the Draft Monument Management Plan. The group discussed some of the language changes proposed. The group recommended changes to the document and Bill Gilmartin made a motion to accept those changes. Cindy Hunter seconded and the motion carried unanimously.
5. RAC Comments on the Monument Management Plan from Sub-Committees—The group then broke into groups for most of the afternoon to discuss RAC

comments that had submitted on the management plan. There was discussion about the possibility of extending the comment period. Following the discussions each of the groups reported out. The permitting group felt that an initiative that was left out was one that related to a biannual assessment of human uses. The research group rearranged the organization of the strategies and activities. The goal was to prioritize what the group termed “management-critical science.” There was a discussion on how this group could reflect these changes. There was a request for a Word Document so that the group could manipulate the text. Hoku Johnson will send it to Cindy Hunter and Bill Gilmartin.

#### IV. PUBLIC COMMENT

- Issac Harp (ʻIlioulaokalani Coalition)—Mr. Harp said he was disappointed that there was not a surveillance and enforcement working group. If the group can be reinstated he would like to participate.
- Dave Raney (Sierra Club)—He appreciates the work that the research group did earlier in the day.
- Stephanie Fried—She also wanted to participate in the enforcement discussion the following day.

#### V. NEXT STEPS

The group discussed the agenda for the following day. The group planned to vote on the discussions and recommendations that happened today, since there is not a quorum at this time in the day. First thing in the morning the breakout groups planned to reconvene. Eric Roberts was tasked with checking on the availability of the USCG conference room for a RAC meeting. The group planned to reconvene at 8:30 am.

#### ADJOURNMENT

Ms. Paul adjourned the meeting for the day.

***NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS  
CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING  
Thursday, June 26, 2008, 9:00 am-4:15 pm  
ONMS Pacific Islands Region Conference Room  
Hawaii Kai, Hawaii***

Draft Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES

Advisory Council Members: Bill Gilmartin (Research); Gail Grabowsky (Education); ‘Aulani Wilhelm (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHI CRER)); William Aila (Native Hawaiian); Don Schug (Research); Linda Paul (Conservation); David Laist (Marine Mammal Commission for Lloyd Lowry); Susan White (Fish and Wildlife Service); Laura Thompson (Conservation); Kem Lowry (Citizen-At-Large); Eric Roberts (US Coast Guard for CDR Mark Young); Jarad Makiau (WESPAC for Kitty Simonds); Cindy Hunter (Research); Margaret Akamine (NOAA NMFS for Mike Tosatto); Tim Johns (State of Hawaii); Louis “Buzzy” Agard (Native Hawaiian);

*Absent:* Alexandra Curtis (U.S. Department of State); Philip Taylor (National Science Foundation); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); CDR Mark Young (U.S. Coast Guard); Kitty Simonds (Western Pacific Fishery Management Council (WPFMC)); Jessica Wooley (Conservation); Lloyd Lowry (Marine Mammal Commission); Mike Tosatto (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), National Marine Fisheries (NMFS)); Becky Hommon (U.S. Navy); Naomi McIntosh (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS)); Carlos Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Matthew Zimmerman (Ocean-Related Tourism)

Alternate Council Members (not representing voting members): Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian); Isabella Abbott (Native Hawaiian); Athline Clark (State of Hawaii)

[NWHI CRER Staff]: Hoku Johnson; Keeley Belva;

[Monument Staff]: Barbara Maxfield (FWS); Jeff Pollack (NOAA OLE);

[Members of the Public]: Issac Harp (‘Ilioulaokalani Coalition); Melva Aila; Stephanie Fried; Dave Raney (Sierra Club); Keiko Bonk (MCBI); Marti Townsend (KAHEA); Jessica Burke (Chaminade student); Elizabeth Pearson (Chaminade student); Laura St. Denis (Chaminade student);

PURPOSES OF THE MEETING:

- 1) Review and discuss Draft Monument Management Plan consolidated comment sheet
- 2) Finalize Reserve Advisory Council comments on Draft Monument Management Plan

#### IV. CALL TO ORDER (PAUL)

Council Vice Chair Linda Paul called the meeting to order and Council Secretary William Aila offered a pule to begin the meeting.

#### V. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (PAUL)

Ms. Paul reviewed the discussions from the previous day of the meeting and reviewed plans for the second day.

#### VI. DECISION-MAKING: FINALIZATION OF RAC COMMENTS

1. Executive Session—The RAC held an executive session to discuss how to proceed and what the ground rules would be for the day.
2. Management Plan Sessions—The RAC broke out into the same groups as the previous day (Research, Permitting, and Native Hawaiian) to continue discussing comments on the Draft Monument Management Plan.
3. Monument Transport Protocol Update—Athline Clark, State Superintendent for the Monument, gave an update on the Monument’s new transport protocol. She made it available for the RAC and explained that it is a work to allow for refinement as better methods are developed. If new issues come up, or if better protocols develop there will be the flexibility to modify the documents.
4. Management Plan Sessions Report Out—The Vice-Chair asked for reports from each of the groups and began discussing the general comments provided by RAC members for the group’s consideration. Don Schug moved to accept “yellow comments” which were previously discussed by the management plan sub-committee. Bill Gilmartin seconded the motion, which passed 7 ayes – 0 nays – 1 abstention. The research subcommittee then reviewed their discussion for the group. They showed a new table of contents for the first Priority Management Needs of the DMMP that was reworked to reflect their priorities. They emphasized that research priorities should be activities management-critical. Kem Lowry moved that the RAC accept the research team’s recommendation to emphasize on management critical research as reflected in the document submitted and discussed, Bill Gilmartin seconded. The motion passed unanimously. The permitting group presented and discussed their recommendations. Don Schug moved to adopt the permitting team comments. Linda Paul seconded and the vote passed unanimously. The enforcement recommendations were reviewed and discussed by the group. Cindy Hunter motioned to accept these recommendations, Buzzy Agard seconded. The motion passed unanimously. The Native Hawaiian group reviewed and discussed their recommendations, as well as the recommendations from the Native Hawaiian Cultural Working Group. Buzzy Agard motioned to adopt these recommendations, William Aila seconded. The motion carried unanimously. The group then reviewed comments on the Threatened and Endangered Species Action Plan. Bill Gilmartin made a motion to accept, Cindy Hunter seconded. The motion carried unanimously. The group reviewed comments on the

Migratory Birds, Reducing Threats, and Habitat Conservation action plans. Linda Paul made a motion to accept comments, Bill Gilmartin seconded, and the motion passed 8 ayes - 0 nays – 1 abstention. The group reviewed comments on the Marine Debris Action Plan and Don Schug made a motion to accept recommended comments, Gail Grabowsky seconded and the motion carried unanimously. The group then discussed comments for the Alien Species Action Plan. Don Schug made a motion to accept the recommendations, Laura Thompson seconded and the motion and it carried unanimously. The group then discussed Maritime Transportation Action Plan, but made no recommendations. Kem Lowry moved to adopt recommendations under the Managing Human Uses section, Bill Gilmartin seconded, and the motion carried unanimously. Gail Grabowsky made a motion to accept comments in the Ocean Literacy Action Plan, Bill Gilmartin seconded. The motion carried unanimously. Final recommendations are included as attachment 1.

5. Letter to Superintendent re: Advisory Council—There was discussion about the letter that Linda Paul drafted from the RAC recommending a Monument advisory council. There was a motion to accept the letter, with an amendment to add 1 science/research seat (3 total), 1 conservation seat (3 total), and to specify that scientists should be non-federal. Laura Thompson made the motion, Bill Gilmartin seconded and it passed with a vote of 9 ayes – 0 nays – 1 abstention.
6. Letter from the RAC on DMMP Recommendations—The group discussed the draft letter addressing recommendations on the DMMP. Bill Gilmartin made a motion to accept Paragraph 5. William Aila seconded the motion and made a friendly amendment to include moving the firing zones away from islands and to state DOD should provide an annual report on negative impacts to PMNM. This motion passed with a vote of 9 ayes – 0 nays – 1 abstention. The group then discussed Paragraph 7 about education. Gail Grabowsky suggested added language that covered education at a national level. Ms. Grabowsky then made a motion to accept these changes, Bill Gilmartin seconded the motion and it passed with a vote of 9 ayes – 0 nays – 1 abstention. The RAC then discussed Paragraph 8 about the budget. Bill Gilmartin made a motion to recommend that the budget follows priorities as stated in letter. Gail Grabowsky seconded the motion which passed with a vote of 9 ayes – 0 nays – 1 abstention. The group then discussed how best to move forward in submitting these recommendations during the public comment period for the Draft Monument Management Plan. Cindy Hunter motioned that the RAC Executive Team will draft the letter based on the RAC’s comments and will email to the RAC for review before submitting comments. Laura Thompson seconded and the motion passed with a vote of 9 ayes – 0 nays – 1 abstention.

## V. NEXT STEPS

The RAC supported an extension of the public comment period, which ends on July 8<sup>th</sup>. They discussed tentatively planning another RAC meeting on July 16<sup>th</sup> to finalize any recommendations if the extension occurred.

#### ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Johns adjourned the meeting.