

***NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS  
CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL WORKSHOP  
Wednesday, December 17, 2008, 9:00 am- 12:00 pm  
ONMS Pacific Islands Region Conference Room  
Hawaii Kai, Hawaii***

Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES

Advisory Council Members: Margaret Akamine (NMFS for Mike Tosatto); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Tim Johns (State of Hawaii); Susan White (US, Fish and Wildlife Service); ‘Aulani Wilhelm (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHI CRER)); William Aila (Native Hawaiian); Linda Paul (Conservation); Laura Thompson (Conservation); Kem Lowry (Citizen-At-Large); Eric Roberts (US Coast Guard); Kelly Finn (WESPAC for Kitty Simonds); Cindy Hunter (Research) via phone; Louis “Buzzy” Agard (Native Hawaiian); Naomi McIntosh (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS));

*Absent:* Alexandra Curtis (U.S. Department of State); Bill Gilmartin (Research); Don Schug (Research); Philip Taylor (National Science Foundation); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); Kitty Simonds (Western Pacific Fishery Management Council (WPFMC)); Jessica Wooley (Conservation); Lloyd Lowry (Marine Mammal Commission); Mike Tosatto (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), National Marine Fisheries (NMFS)); Becky Hommon (U.S. Navy); Bobby Gomes (Commercial Fishing); Carlos Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Matthew Zimmerman (Ocean-Related Tourism)

Alternate Council Members (not representing voting members): Athline Clark (State of Hawaii for Tim Johns); Tammy Harp (via phone)

[NWHI CRER Staff]: Keeley Belva; Andy Collins; Kimo Carvalho; Kristen Johns; Hoku Johnson; Elizabeth Keenan; Brady Phillips; Justin Rivera;

[Monument Staff]: David Weingartner (State of Hawaii); Doug Runde (State of Hawaii); Barbara Maxfield (Fish and Wildlife Service);

[Members of the Public]: Marti Townsend (KAHEA); Allison Rieser (UH); Derek Chang (Referentia);

PURPOSES OF THE MEETING:

- 1) Receive briefing on the final Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument management plan
- 2) Discuss future of RAC and Monument “Alliance”

I. CALL TO ORDER (JOHNS)

Council Chair Tim Johns called the meeting to order and Council Secretary William Aila offered a pule to begin the meeting. Mr. Aila took roll and the participants introduced themselves.

## II. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (JOHNS)

Mr. Johns reviewed the agenda for the day.

## III. BRIEFING ON MONUMENT MANGEMENT PLAN (PHILLIPS)

Brady Phillips, Office of National Marine Sanctuaries management plan coordinator for the Monument, gave a presentation of some of the highlights from the plan. The plan has not yet been released, but RAC members will receive copies once it is. Mr. Phillips reviewed the contents of each of the five volumes in the plan—the fifth volume is new and consists of the agencies’ response to public comments. The RAC had some questions on the timing of activities in the management plan and what the RAC’s involvement would be in future activities.

The RAC asked for an update on the World Heritage status for the Monument. Athline Clark reviewed the current status and gave an overview of the anticipated timeline for the nomination of the Monument. Papahānaumokuākea will be nominated as a mixed (natural and cultural) site. UNESCO will then review the nomination and make a decision no earlier than 2010. Obtaining a World Heritage site status would not change any of the management or restrictions that are already in place. It will provide for more interaction with other World Heritage sites and highlight the Monument on an international stage.

ACTION: Keeley will send the link to the permit report on the website.

## IV. BRIEFING AND DISCUSSION ON RAC FUTURE AND MONUMENT “ALLIANCE” (PHILLIPS/WILHELM)

Brady Phillips and `Aulani Wilhelm presented what the management plan outlines concerning an advisory body. It talks about a Monument “Alliance” which would be established within one year. The “Alliance” would be subject to the Federal Advisory Committees Act (FACA), but could potentially seek a FACA exemption. There were questions as to what the authority to have consensus advice is. There was discussion as to how other SACs work with agency partners. There was further discussion on the benefits of consensus verses individual advice.

## V. DISCUSSION ON POTENTIAL 2009 RAC SCHEUDLE

The group discussed tentative dates for 2009 RAC meetings. The thought was that in general Wednesdays worked better for the group. Tentative dates suggested were 18/19 March, 9/10 June, 9/10 September, and 2/3 December. The group will tentatively plan on these dates unless a conflicting event is put forward. There was discussion on potential topics for

ACTION: Keeley will email the RAC with the tentative dates.

## VI. PUBLIC COMMENT

- Marti Townsend (KAHEA)—Ms. Townsend was heartened to see more details during this briefing. She wanted to hear more about the number of visitors to Midway Atoll. She felt that there is less public engagement which could help advocate for the alliance to be FACA approved/exempt. Ms. Townsend expressed concern with the formality as to how activities will be implemented and was disappointed that the permitting process hasn’t been amended in any way, having no way for RAC or another body to comment on the permits. She was concerned with

- the process of the managers' permit. She reminded the RAC that this isn't final, can continually be improved. Would like to see permitting reports posted on the website.
- Letise LaFeir (National Marine Sanctuary Foundation)—Ms. LaFeir introduced herself and told the group about some of the efforts that the NMSF is working on including advocating for changes in the National Marine Sanctuaries Act. She informed the group that HR 6537 is the Bill that is currently in the queue for Congress to review and explained more about the process of reauthorization.
  - Susan White told the group a little bit about the upcoming 100<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Hawaiian Islands National Wildlife Refuge. FWS is planning events that will happen in conjunction with this event. The anniversary is on February 3<sup>rd</sup>.
  - Tammy Harp (via phone)—Ms. Harp asked about cumulative impacts affecting the Monument. She mentioned monitoring volcanic emissions that could be having a negative impact on monk seals. She also asked about: 1. Understanding cumulative impacts: Will scientific activities apply in this understanding? Humans initiate scientific activities. How much science do we need? 2. Global Climate Change: If deposits of sand, dirt, and other particles can descend upon Florida from the Sahara Desert, is there monitoring of volcanic emissions during Kona winds/storms and their possible impacts up there? 3. Hawaiian Monk Seals: What efforts are being done to remove arsenic/toxic materials from main haul areas? How many generations need to go by before the monk seals will be arsenic-free? Or are we witnessing the slow extinction of the monk seals due to cumulative impacts of the DOD?

## V. NEXT STEPS

The group will make plans for the 2009 meetings during a planning session following this meeting (see attachment 1).

## ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Johns adjourned the meeting.

## Attachment 1

### **RAC Planning and Brainstorming Session**

**17 December 2008**

**1:00 – 3:00 p.m.**

#### **Attendees**

Buzzy Agard, William Aila, Keeley Belva, Kimo Carvalho, Kelly Finn, Gail Grabowsky, Tim Johns, Hoku Johnson, Kem Lowry, Linda Paul, Jeff Pollack, Eric Roberts, 'Aulani Wilhelm, Susan White

#### **Brainstorming session on RAC 2009 initiatives**

- Advisory Council Chairs Meeting
  - National SAC
  - Management Plan Review?

- RAC/SAC offices in Hawaii Kai
- Permit Forum
  - Broad trends, monitoring, results, public venue, compliance vs. non-compliance
- Charter for Alliance
  - Roles and Responsibilities
- Natural Resources Science Plan
- Engagement in Monument Management Plan
- Threat assessment
- Native Hawaiian Working Group
- Marine Debris
- Evaluation/Tracking
- Links between RAC and other advisory-type groups
  - Meeting of groups
  - NWHI Research Symposium
  - Coral Reef Working Group
  - Friends of Midway Atoll
  - HIHWNMS Advisory Council
- Membership of Monument Alliance
  - Add terrestrial, historic preservation, veterans
- Establishment of PMNM “support” group
- Form Sub-committees/working groups
- Native Hawaiian Research Plan
- Alien Species
- “Housekeeping”
  - Committees/Working Groups
  - Monthly Calls
- RAC/PMNM topic briefings or lectures

### **Planning for RAC 2009 meetings**

Prior to March 2009

- Native Hawaiian Working group on Native Hawaiian Research Plan

March 18-19

- Threat Assessment Update and Sub-Committee
- Evaluation/Tracking Presentation and Feedback
- Natural Resources Science Plan
- Links between RAC and “other groups”
- SAC Chairs Representative
- Monument Alliance Charter Sub-Committee
- Review Permit Report

June 9-10

- Threat Assessment Recommendations
- Friend Groups Presentations
- Include Interest groups (possible members of the Alliance)

- Evaluation/Tracking recommendations?

September 9-10

- 

December 9-10

- Establishment of PMNM support group