

***NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS
CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL***

April 27, 2012, 9am- 5pm
Office of National Marine Sanctuaries

Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES

Advisory Council Members: Tim Johns (State of Hawai‘i); Louis “Buzzy” Agard (Native Hawaiian Elder); Linda Paul (Conservation); Bill Gilmartin (Research); Kem Lowry (Citizen-At-Large); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Joshua DeMello (WPFMC for Kitty Simonds); Don Palawski (US, Fish and Wildlife); Eric Roberts (US Coast Guard); Samantha Brooke (NMFS for Mike Tosatto); Janice Fukawa (U.S. Navy for Becky Hommon); Malia Chow (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS)); Cynthia Vanderlip (State of Hawai‘i for Maria Carnevale); ‘Aulani Wilhelm (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHI CRER)); teleconference: Don Schug (Research); teleconference: Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian); teleconference: Jessica Wooley (Conservation);

Absent: Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); Cindy Hunter (Research); Laura Thompson (Conservation); Bobby Gomes (Commercial Fishing); Kitty Simonds (Western Pacific Fishery Management Council (WPFMC)); Philip Taylor (National Science Foundation); Mike Tosatto (National Marine Fisheries (NMFS)); Take Tomson (NOAA – OLE)

[NWHI CRER Staff]: David Swatland, Andy Collins, Wesley Byers

[US, Fish and Wildlife Service]: Dan Polhemus; Ray Born

[Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary]: Joe Paulin

[Members of the Public]: Barb Mayer (Public); Judith Tarpley (Public); Matt Saunter (DLNR DOFAW); Don May (Earth Corps)

PURPOSE OF THE MEETING:

1. Receive updates on Monument activities and reports on related efforts.
2. Receive briefings on major initiatives such as the Campaign of Engagement, USFWS Wilderness Area Review & Designation Proposal, and several other Monument projects.
3. Evaluation Strategy Update
4. Monument Alliance Charter Update

I. CALL TO ORDER (JOHNS)

Chair Tim Johns called the meeting to order

Opening Protocol – [NWHI CRER Staff]: Blane Benevedes, Keali‘i Sagum
Introductions

Mr. Johns reviewed the agenda for the meeting.

II. REVIEW OF ACTION ITEMS AND STATUS (JOHNS)

Byers: Update on Posting RAC Information to the website. **Swatland:** Update on guidelines with communicating with the RAC. Our new Communications Coordinator will be working on developing a communications strategy. We are aiming for a draft of the Communications Strategy by July 1st. **Johns:** We will look forward to seeing that at the next meeting.

III. TOPIC A: MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE/MGT. AGENCY UPDATES (VANDERLIP, PALAWSKI, ROBERTS, WILHELM, SALBOSA)

Vanderlip: State DAR/DoFAW Update: Maria is ill today. Most has remained the same at DLNR since the last RAC meeting. The Co-Manager position remains unfilled and permit coordinator, Maria Carnevale remains acting in this role. A research coordinator was hired- Michelle Phillips started in late February. The DAR/DOFAW proposed reorganization was put on hold during the legislative session and First Deputy, Guy Kaulukukui remains acting DAR Administrator. Kure Atoll Field Update: January - March 2012; Department of Land and Natural Resources; Division of Forestry and Wildlife: 2nd winter camp bush cut 2 acres - 50 person hours; Winter Camp sprayed 80 acres – 1358 hours; vegetation monitoring quadrats; dune restoration – planting; native grasses (*L. repens*) and Naupaka; winter camp heliotrope control, 201 hours. Pulled 45,000, chemical treatment - 1200. Wildlife hazards remediation; winter monk seal monitoring - 282 person hours: KB38 entangled and KB38 disentangled, soldering iron used to remove ring. This was the second successful use of this tool. The first was during the winter of 2011 when a pregnant seal was disentangled using the soldering iron. 5000 pounds of nets and lines collected from August 2011 - March 2012; vessel ID 26-10 wrecked on Kure March 2nd, 2012; 2012 buildings locations: facilities maintenance person, 400 hours (not including bunkhouse hours).

Palawski: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service/National Wildlife Refuge System: I'll be acting FWS Superintendent for the immediate future and hoping that we can fill the position after October 1st. Agency Accomplishments and Recent Activities: Habitat Restoration and Alien Species: View of the runway from the west end of Tern Island. Lines are approximately where vegetation was cleared to until June 2011 – just seven months ago. Although regrowth is uneven (and much more sparse at the other end). Dan Rapp spotted an oiled red-footed booby on the northeast seawall of Tern the week of February 19th – 25th. We had a second oiled-bird sighting of the season on Tern on March 14th, with a red-footed booby having about 15% of its body surface covered in oil. Emergency Response: Successful Medevac on March 31st. A Japanese fishing vessel had an injured crew member that was transported to Midway. Midway staff John Miller and Jason Beatty along with MOCC instructor James Fitzgerald picked up the patient from the fishing vessel and transferred him to shore. Refuge Operations Infrastructure: Painting of the Midway Visitor Center by DBSI was completed January 9th -15th. At Midway Atoll NWR, DBSI installed new windows in the FWS Visitor Center and Archival Room. Shade cloth installed around lead-based paint remediation buildings at Midway continues to function well. It has been effective thus far to prevent albatross from nesting around the buildings and has been unaffected by strong winds. Tern Island Seawall CFO-3.6: Maintain and enhance the infrastructure at French Frigate Shoals: Recommend replacing the degrading seawall on Tern as a highest priority recommendation for Tern or inevitable loss of the island will take place. It is over 70yrs old and failing to provide protection needed to the island and its infrastructure. The seawall in its current state also poses danger to both humans and wildlife in the form of sudden collapse events, wildlife entrapments, and habitat loss/increased erosion. Visitor Services Midway Atoll

NWR: Very successful visitors' services program at midway this year representing universities, eco-tourism and volunteers. On Midway, the world's oldest living albatross, Wisdom (at least 61 years old), hatched her chick the week of January 30th – February 4th as well as one of the Laysan/black-footed albatross hybrid paired with a Laysan. Research and Monitoring: Nihoa Millerbird: February 19th – 25th: Nest building has begun, with individuals from 5 different pairs seen carrying nesting material. One (nearly complete) nest has been found so far. Hawaiian green sea turtle: March 11th -17th: Hawaiian green sea turtle numbers on Tern are increasing – from an average of 0-1 per day, to 8-15/day on Tern Island beaches. We expect these numbers to rise to 50-75 per day over the next couple months. The first Hawaiian green sea turtle nest of the season was found on Tern on South Beach the week of March 18th -24th. Dr. Balaz tells us that this is a new record for first nest of the year. **Gilmartin**(question): What is going on with the shark, monk seal issue at FFS? **Palawski**: The permit was issued and the plan is to move forward. The shark culling crew will start in June.

Wilhelm: NOAA: NOAA ONMS Update: Superintendent's Report to the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem. Agency accomplishments and recent activities: staff changes: arrivals: Toni Parras (Communications Coordinator), Blane Benevedes (Native Hawaiian Program Specialist), Keali'i Sagum (Native Hawaiian Research Associate) and Micki Ream (Data Documentation and Outreach Specialist). Strategic Initiatives: PMNM Participates in World Heritage Marine Site Workshop PMNM participated in a three day workshop February 26th -29th hosted and funded by UNESCO's World Heritage Marine Programme and the German Federal Agency for Nature Conservation (BfN). The workshop was held at the International Academy for Nature Conservation on the island of Vilm, Germany, in the Baltic Sea, and was the first in a series to develop user-friendly guidelines for present and future World Heritage marine site managers to use in managing their sites, including day-to-day management, fundraising, reporting requirements, and focusing on ecosystem based management and sustainability. The first meeting focused on quantifying Outstanding Universal Values and how to develop measureable standards. Representatives from three other WH marine sites, UNESCO, the IMO (Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission), and Germany's BfN attended. The next meeting will be in May, 2012. Agency Coordination: PMNM represented at NOAA Sentinel Sites Implementation Workshop PMNM staff played a key role in the first NOAA Sentinel Site Program National Workshop in Silver Spring, MD, helping to develop a framework for Sentinel Site Cooperatives to use in drafting local/regional implementation plans. The workshop drafted guidance on how best to align NOAA and partner capacities in addressing threats such as marine debris and alien species, as well as sea level rise and other impacts of climate change. Constituency Building and Outreach: ONMS/PMNM Outreach Activities ONMS/PMNM conducted outreach activities at a number of high profile events.

Papahānaumokuākea staff member Hokuala Johnson and Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale Sanctuary Superintendent Malia Chow presented jointly to Environmental Planning students at the University of Hawai'i's Department of Urban and Regional Planning. Benjamin Parker Elementary School in Kaneohe, hosted a classroom presentation by Reserve Advisory Council Education Working Group member and USFWS volunteer, Barb Mayer and PMNM staff. PMNM staff provided an overview of PMNM and the NWHI. Students participated in an activity, "Let's go to Tern Island," which took the students onto the cargo ship Kahana to Tern Island - virtually. Students also participated in a Laysan Albatross Chick Monitoring activity and watched a short video about albatross heading out to sea in search of food. Students also had the opportunity to Skype with the current Tern Island volunteers and staff. Earth Day Outreach

Activities ONMS/PMNM conducted outreach activities at a number of events. Moloka‘i Earth Day Celebration was held Friday, April 20th. Sponsored by The Nature Conservancy, the event focused on educating residents and visitors about the part they can play in preserving our natural and cultural resources. Two PMNM staff manned the Monument’s exhibit table to inform on and promote the Monument, sustainability, and living pono. Many residents of Moloka‘i attended the event, which included food, live music and exhibits from more than a dozen conservation organizations. With an attendance of almost 1000 people, the annual celebration is one of the biggest events held on the island. As part of the O‘ahu’s many Earth Day celebrations, over a thousand students, teachers, families and numerous local businesses and community organizations – including PMNM - gathered to share their resources and expertise during Punahou School’s Sustainability Fair on April 20th. The goal of the Sustainability Fair is to increase awareness about living sustainably and educating people about issues surrounding water, waste, food, energy and transportation. PMNM staff informed students about the monument’s unique features and the threats facing them, and answered questions from students, teachers and others. Approximately 250 people attended the Mālamalama Waldorf School’s Spring Faire and Earth Day Event on Saturday, April 21st. The day was filled with fun activities for families including face painting, medieval games, entertainment, great food, and free craft activities for the keiki. Papahānaumokuākea staff hosted an interactive exhibit which focused on ocean acidification. Education: Navigating Change Program Host Students, Teachers, and Parents at Camp Erdman Navigating Change hosted 70 students, teachers, and parents from Island Pacific Academy at Camp Erdman on February 16th -17th and 100 more from Kamaile Academy at Camp Erdman on March 8th -9th. Students experienced four installed activities including mauka-to-makai hike, native plant restoration on the coastline, albatross intro and bolus exam, and celestial movement/star compass introduction. In addition, students took part in the newly added marine debris activity which resulted in the removal of approximately 70 lbs. of trash from the coastline. Waialua Elementary School Hosts Navigating Change Program Marine Biodiversity and Research Activities Presentations. Over 80 elementary students participated in a Navigating Change program at Waialua Elementary School on April 4th. PMNM staff presented fourth graders with information and underwater photographs of the unique marine flora and fauna of NWHI, and talked about the logistical challenges of conducting research in the remote region. Mokuāpapa Discovery Center Highlights Discovery Center staff conducted a number of outreach activities: Mokuāpapa welcomed the center’s 500,000th visitor since it opened in 2003, Ms. Susan Murphy from Carmel California. Over 2,200 people attended the 2012 Ocean Day Mālama Kanaloa Festival, where MDC staff and volunteers helped children create gyotaku fish prints and learn about invasive fish species in Hawai‘i and their impacts on Hawai‘i’s reefs. This event was funded by the Hawai‘i Experimental Programs for Stimulating Competitive Research (EPSCoR), the University of Hawai‘i at Hilo Student Association (UHHSA), and UH Sea Grant. MDC hosted a workshop with Jim Foley from the Center for Microbial Oceanography Research and Education (CMORE). The workshop was attended by 14 teachers representing public and charter schools from almost all districts on Hawai‘i Island. Among the participants were two members of the Discovery Center’s teacher roundtable. The teachers received training to use microscopes with video and photo capabilities along with the software and laptop computers needed to fully utilize the microscope’s capabilities. Field Operations: ONMS Holds NOAA’s First Closed-Circuit Rebreather Dive Training. Monument technical divers joined several ONMS staff from other sites to organize and complete NOAA’s first official training in the use of closed-circuit rebreathers. This advanced technology recycles gases the divers breathe by

removing carbon dioxide and actively managing oxygen levels, resulting in increased decompression efficiency while allowing more time underwater. Immediate applications include exploration of mesophotic coral ecosystems (50-150m) and documentation of maritime heritage resources at depths beyond the reach of conventional SCUBA. ONMS has led the charge to get this technology accepted and approved by the NOAA Diving Program, and will continue to develop best practices and procedures for safe use of this technology throughout all of NOAA. Research: Poster Featured at 5th International Deep-Sea Coral Symposium. A poster featuring recent research efforts to characterize mesophotic coral reef ecosystems in the NWHI was featured at the 5th International Deep-Sea Coral Symposium in Amsterdam, Netherlands. Hawaiian Black Corals Featured in Prestigious Scientific Journal. A study on the reproduction of Hawaiian black corals will be published soon in the scientific journal Coral Reefs. Native Hawaiian: Papahānaumokuākea Leads Blessing Ceremony for NOAA Pacific Regional Center at Ford Island. On February 21st, ONMS staff from Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument led the blessing ceremony of the first building completed and soon to be occupied at the new NOAA Pacific Regional Center (PRC) on Ford Island. The blessing and dedication of the building was attended by several VIPs including Dr. Jane Lubchenco, Senator Daniel K Inouye, Congresswomen Mazie Hirono and Colleen Hanabusa and Hawai'i Governor Neil Abercrombie. Papahānaumokuākea Focus-Group Meetings: PMNM successfully completed the first round of state-wide focus-group meetings in support of the development of its Native Hawaiian Research Plan (NHRP). The NHRP is one of several step-down plans specifically required by the Monument Management Plan (MMP). PMNM and the Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA) have partnered to develop the NHRP and the Native Hawaiian Cultural Working Group (CWG) provided the primary guidance for the development process.

Roberts: US Coast Guard: Summary of U.S. Coast Guard (USCG) Marine Protected Species activities in the Papahānaumokuākea from February 1st to March 31st, 2012. During this reporting period, Air Station Barbers Point was not able to fly any dedicated law enforcement patrols of the PMNM. This is due to a significant number of fisheries law enforcement operations that were occurring throughout our Pacific Remote Island Areas. During this reporting period, Air Station Barbers Point conducted four deployments covering seventeen days. These deployments provided valuable fisheries enforcement and surveillance opportunities to the remote exclusive economic zones of Howland and Baker Islands, Jarvis Island, Johnston Atoll, Wake Island, and Guam and the Northern Marianas Islands. Similarly, we did not have any surface assets operating within the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands during this time period. Although three cutters were also engaged in fisheries enforcement patrols throughout the Western and Central Pacific Ocean as referenced above. In addition, we dedicated over two-hundred local resource hours to our Operation Kohola Guardian in support of the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary. This support included dedicated enforcement patrols of the Sanctuary and large whale entanglement responses conducted by our patrol boats and medium-range helicopters. **Gilmartin**(question): Any projections on budget to continue this type of support? **Roberts:** Coast Guard on a whole we are looking at cut-backs. **Gilmartin**(question): How does this district compare with other districts nationally? **Roberts:** This district is the largest geographical district in the nation.

Salbosa: Update on Permitted Activities; for the 2012 Calendar year visitor season: 1 Education permit: Duke University field studies course; 9 Special Ocean Use eco-tour groups from various organizations: Pacific Seabird Group; Wildlife and Nature Travel Expeditions; Galapagos Travel; Oceanic Society and Joseph Van Os Photo Safaris. November/December

through June is the visitors season on Midway Atoll National Wildlife Refuge. 27 Permit applications were received for February 1st application deadline: 2 Conservation and Management; 2 Education; 1 Native Hawaiian Practices; 14 Research and 8 Special Ocean Use. 5 Permit applications received in advance of upcoming May 1st application deadline; 2011 Permitted Activities Report well underway and will be distributed at next RAC meeting; plans underway to have permittees provide updates to the RAC on activities conducted in PMNM and project results. February 1st applications are typically for the upcoming summer research field season – and we are working diligently to process these in time for the upcoming cruises. Issues with some servers at headquarters thus there was a delay in updating the Permitting Program section of the Monument website; looking to have that completed in May. **Lowry**(question): What is an example of a special ocean use permit? **Salbosa**: Specifically for commercial activities that generate revenue, such as Wildlife and nature travel tour groups or film projects, photography and books. **Johns**(question): Do we have limits on the number of permits issued? **Salbosa**: No we don't have a limit on the number of application we can process or accept. **Paul**(question): How many Special Ocean Use permits are outside of Midway? **Salbosa**: We typically have 3-4 outside of Midway Atoll. These permits must directly benefit the conservation and management of the Monument. **Johns**(question): How does the application cycle work? **Salbosa**: We have deadlines February 1st, May 1st and September 1st. **Johns**(question): When do make decisions on those? **Salbosa**: Typically it takes 3-4 months to process the permits. **Johns**: I want to make sure that the council knows how much activity is going on in the Monument. **Wilhelm**: We can provide a snapshot at every meeting. **Gilmartin**: We need to have permittees in front of us at each meeting. **Johns**: You could make them present to us if it becomes a condition of the permit. **Roberts**: It would be beneficial for the law-enforcement task force, if we could have knowledge and visibility on the maritime-based activities ahead of time. **Polhemus**: The outputs from that meeting could also be circulated even if you couldn't make the meeting. **Paul**: Please include us on any brown-bag lunches by permittees. **Johns**: In your agency reports add third party permittees. The idea is that we get an overall sense of what happens up there. This is kind of a lagging indicator of what happens.

IV. TOPIC B: USFWS WILDERNESS AREA REVIEW AND DESIGNATION PROPOSAL (PALAWSKI)

Palawski: Pacific Islands National Wildlife Refuges Wilderness Review: when, what and why; benefits; how/timeline; passed in 1964: the Wilderness Act, Pub. Law 88-577, 16 U.S.C. 1131-1136. This Act establishes a National Wilderness Preservation System. Wilderness character has biophysical, experiential, and symbolic components that distinguishes wilderness from all other lands and may distinguish one wilderness from another. Five qualities of wilderness character: untrammeled: wilderness is essentially unhindered and free from modern human control or manipulation; undeveloped: without structures and the use of motors or mechanical transport that increase human ability to occupy or modify the environment; natural: substantially free from the effects of modern civilization; solitude for primitive and unconfined recreation. Separation from other people and reminders of civilization; travel by non-motorized and non-mechanical means (e.g., horse, foot, canoe); reliance on personal skills to travel and camp, rather than reliance on facilities or outside help; and freedom from societal or managerial controls; Unique values: values that are not required to be present in every wilderness; if present, they must be protected as rigorously as the "required" qualities, but always in a wilderness context. Ecological, geological, scientific, scenic, educational, or historic values. Generally Prohibited Uses: Sec.4(c):

commercial enterprises, permanent roads, temporary roads, motor vehicles, motorized equipment, landing of aircraft, mechanical transport, structures and installations. Sec.4(d)(6): except to realize the recreational or other wilderness purposes of the area; except as necessary to meet minimum requirements for the administration of the area as wilderness. Relevant Wilderness Act Provisions: Sec.2.(a): established a National Wilderness Preservation System (DOA, DOI), Sec.3.(c): required DOI to review all refuge and National Park areas within 10 years (by September 3rd, 1974) and provide recommendation, Sec.3.(d)(1): requires public notice, hearings, etc. and all views accompany any recommendation to the President and Congress. 1964: the Wilderness Act, 1974, June 13th: Hawaiian Islands National Wildlife Refuge Wilderness Proposal 2006, June 15th: Presidential Proclamation 8031 establishing Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Marine National Monument; 2007: FWS Director's 5-year delay of wilderness review (review must be initiated by December 2012, 5 years after completion of MMP); 2012, October 9th: Refuge Management Plans, including wilderness reviews, must be completed. Relevant Provisions of Hawaiian Islands Wilderness Proposal: "The Hawaiian Islands National Wildlife Refuge will continue to be managed by the [Fish and Wildlife Service] consistent with the purposes for which the area was established so as to preserve its wilderness character." Submerged lands and waters eliminated from proposal due to unclear ownership or navigability. Benefits of designated wilderness: complements and supplements other designations by preserving wilderness character and values not always addressed by natural and cultural resource laws. Ensures perpetuation of traditional landscape. Adds teeth to protection not offered by "honorary" designations such as World Heritage, Ramsar, etc. Overwhelming public support (74-91%) for wilderness and open space due to strong, long-standing values. IUCN considers wilderness designation among the highest levels of protection for a conservation area. FWS Wilderness Review Process: identify lands and waters that meet the minimum criteria for wilderness. Evaluate Wilderness Study Areas to determine if they are suitable for wilderness designation. Determine areas we will recommend for designation as wilderness. Minimum Criteria for Wilderness Study Area (WSA) qualification, required: size, appears natural, and opportunities for solitude or recreation (can be either or for solitude and recreation). Not required: unique values. Size: has at least 5,000 acres of land or is of sufficient size to make practicable its preservation and use in an unconfined condition, or is a roadless island. Appears natural: generally appears to have been affected primarily by the forces of nature, with the imprint of man's work substantially unnoticeable. Solitude: has outstanding opportunities for solitude. Recreation: has outstanding opportunities for primitive and unconfined recreation. Unique values: contains ecological, geological, or other features of scientific, educational, scenic, or historic value. **Johns**(question): How does this designation add teeth? **Palawski**: In describing the wilderness character in way that describes the ecological integrity or cultural significance then that would be written into law. **Gilmartin**(question): Does this come with access restrictions or other guidelines in terms of how to preserve? **Palawski**: That's up to the managing agencies. There would be another box that would need to be checked to make sure that it does not detract from the wilderness character. **Paul**(question): In other wilderness areas across the U.S. what role does the Native American community play in this? **Palawski**: I would want to get back to you on that since I don't have the experience to answer that question well. **Palawski**(continues): timeline, important dates: NOI release – 12/16/2011; wilderness workshop – 1/17-18/2012; public scoping period end – 2/29/2012; draft LEIS filed/NOA published – June 2012; public hearing – July 2012 and final LEIS filed/NOA published – September 2012; CCPs for refuges existing in October 1997 must be completed in October 2012, including their

wilderness reviews. **Paul**(question): What is the push back in Congress and why has this languished so long? **Palawski**: It takes someone to pick it up and push it. **Johns**(question): If the RAC would want to provide comments, when would we do that? **Palawski**: I could continue to give planning updates and then the next opportunity would be when the draft is released to the public. **Johns**: Any reason for the RAC to write a letter? **Paul**: The RAC could make a formal request for information? **Johns**: Linda if you could work on a letter to send to FWS and we could look at that before the end of the day.

MOTION: A motion was made by Tim Johns to approve the minutes from the last meeting. Motion carried unanimously by voice vote.

MOTION: A motion was made by Bill Gilmartin to draft a series of questions regarding the FWS wildernesses area review and designation proposal as it affects the Monument. Motion carried unanimously by voice vote.

V. Public Comment - No one from the public volunteered to comment.

LUNCH

VI. PRESENTATION: NAVIGATING MY COURSE (GLEASON/LIMTIACO)

Gleason: Introduction to Navigating My Course: Essentially a 3-day workshop to develop a network of mentors between women working in conservation and science with young women in high school. We have an interest in perpetuating this program and we would like to grow and develop it. We hope you can help us develop partnerships and funding potential for this program (shows video).

VII. TOPIC C: NATIVE HAWAIIAN RESEARCH PLAN UPDATE (KUOHA)

Kuoha: Approach to plan development: guided by Native Hawaiian Cultural Working Group(CWG); contract an author to write the plan; conduct focus-group meetings around Hawai'i; be selective in choosing meeting participants: experience in research from a Hawaiian perspective, cultural practitioner willing to discuss research in the NWHI; CWG members to be point of contacts (POC) in each community; NOAA/OHA find additional POCs where needed; NOAA/OHA depend on POC for guidance on: participants meeting date, time, and site meeting protocol; NOAA/OHA fill in where needed. Focus-group communities, meeting venues and POCs: Hilo, Kona, Hāna (Claudia Kalaola), Kahului, Kaunakakai (Mikiala Pescaia), Honolulu, He'eia, Wai'anae (Walterbea Aldeguer), Hanalei and Waimea. Covers timetable. Meeting Format: background: ancestral connections; chiefly visits and claims; conservation history; recent Hawaiian research and plan background. Discussion: what is Hawaiian research, NWHI relate to Hawaiian research, and research questions. Meeting outcomes: NWHI highly relevant; redefining "research": methods and connection; basis in practice and functionality; balance access: minimize impact and increase opportunities; and research questions. Next steps: continue to collect feedback and build relations: agency focus-group; synthesize feedback: themes; research questions; areas for further development; literature review: Hawaiian ways of knowing; return to communities; research question development; midway access: researchers and practitioners, Hawaiian research methods, produce/refine research focus; and we look to do this under the manager's permit.

VIII. TOPIC D: EVALUATION STRATEGY UPDATE (LOWRY/MILLER)

Lowry/Miller: Background: the Evaluation Strategy is intended to serve as an overarching framework for tracking progress and evaluating the effectiveness of strategies used to manage and protect Monument resources, and to facilitate learning from experience in order to design potential management adaptations. The Evaluation Strategy Version 1.0 was completed as required in the Monument Management Plan and presented to the Monument Management Board (MMB) in October, 2011. A phased roll-out of the Evaluation Strategy was initiated in December 2011. The evaluation lead, program leads, management board and advisory council will work together to complete the roll-out. Current status: Phase 1: management effectiveness review and reporting on activities conducted from January 1st, 2011 through December 31st, 2011. This phase is in progress. 2011 Implementation status reviews and effectiveness reviews were conducted for 15 of the 22 Action Plans in the MMP. Due to time and other constraints, these reviews mainly encapsulate activities undertaken by ONMS and OHA, rather than the full array of Co-Trustee partners. The completed Action Plan reviews are available for MMB and RAC review. A 2011 Annual Monument Report is in preparation, employing the data gathered. This report summarizes accomplishments and lessons learned. It is being prepared as a test case for 2011 to determine its potential for future Monument-wide reporting. Phase 2: annual tracking and evaluation process and online tools for 2012. This phase was initiated for calendar year 2012 but has experienced delays due to staff diversions to tsunami debris modeling and other projects. Online reporting tool – delayed, new target date for completion is May 2012. User training materials for the online reporting tool are being developed. An orientation to evaluation reporting was conducted for ONMS staff in March; additional evaluation orientation and training sessions are yet to be conducted with all Co-Trustee partners (target: May-June). Some POCs still need to be identified for these training sessions. Upcoming (per evaluation strategy rollout) Phase 3: Activities required for the 5-year management plan review and update. The following activities are planned to commence in Q2 and Q3 of 2012: MMB to establish inter-agency management plan review team (MMB Plan Review Team). MMB Plan Review Team and RAC Evaluation Working Group to review outputs of 2011 and 2012 Management Plan evaluation reporting. Evaluation Lead to conduct data gathering (accomplishments, and as possible, plan implementation status) for 2009 and 2010, in preparation for comprehensive 5 year review. Evaluation lead, MMB plan review team, program leads and RAC to conduct consultations and develop draft revised Management Plan framework. **Lowry:** What Alyssa and I have discussed was how the RAC can be involved and we thought of taking the 15 of the 22 action plans reviews that have been done and distributing them to the Evaluation Working Group. We will divvy them up and send out a first draft of a template to guide our own review. The intention of this review is to get more detailed information on what is happening with the action plans, see in how they might be improved and generate evaluative questions that would feed into the 5 year review. We would like to, by the August meeting, have a preliminary set of evaluative questions that could be used as a starting place for a RAC discussion. Anybody who is interested in this can request a review packet and join the working group. We will have a product for the next meeting.

IX. TOPIC E: CHARTER FOR THE ALLIANCE WORKING GROUP (GILMARTIN/COLLINS)

Collins: From our last meeting two of the main points were to clarify quorum and also how the selection process works. Provides clarification of how selection process works for the RAC. We

have asked the group to come back with broader revisions today. Reviews draft charter by section. **Johns:** Don asked for a table to be included at the previous meeting. **Collins:** We did include that in the charter. **Johns**(question): Do we want to approve this and send it to 'Aulani?

MOTION: A motion was made by Bill Gilmartin to approve this draft of the Alliance Charter. Motion carried unanimously by voice vote.

X. TOPIC F: CAMPAIGN OF ENGAGEMENT (PAUL/SWATLAND)

Swatland: The World in Which We Live: A Summary of the Sanctuaries Landscape in 2012:

1) The public discourse is only going to get uglier; think carefully about what you want to say and exactly how you're going to say it. 2) Facts don't matter anymore; stories do. 3) Find your crowd...find the people that want to help you tell your story. And do it digitally. 4) If you can't say it in a video, don't bother. 5) If you can't say it in 8 seconds, don't bother. "Which of the following is the most important issue facing the country today? Do you think the U.S. government is doing too much, too little, or about the right amount in terms of protecting the environment? Is the quality of the environment in the country as a whole is getting better or getting worse? The Political Landscape. The NOAA Landscape. Comparison of Mean Annual Budgets, FY04-10. % of Total Department of Interior Budget, FY2009. NOAA Accomplishments, 2010 Blue Book. Office of National Marine Sanctuaries Funding, FY00-11. Operating Funds per Area Managed in FY 2010. FTE per Area Managed in FY 2010. Comparison of Enacted Funds by Agency, FY01-10. Key Points: A rapidly changing demographic; A society barraged with information; only the most compelling stories make it through all the noise; Digital communication is the tool of choice for most; An angry populace passionate about what matters to them; The environment is still relevant, but ranks low; Congressional gridlock is not going away; The 112th will not prioritize environmental issues; There are ocean supporters, but NOAA Champions are vague; NGOs are focused elsewhere; those that care lack horsepower; NOAA's focus continues to be on fish, weather, and satellites; ONMS survives fiscally, but struggles for agency support with all major initiatives and We are an anomaly; terrestrial parks and MPAs are being designated elsewhere. TYPES OF CAMPAIGNS: Advertising/marketing; Political; Public awareness; Fundraising and Social media. What are WE doing? Designing a National Interest Campaign: An organizational process for creating, communicating, and delivering value to new audiences in ways to build a larger influential coalition; it may include elements of all other types of campaigns. Why are we doing it? What is our overarching goal? Building a Larger Coalition: a coalition is a group of people and entities that cooperate towards a common goal; provide more visibility, credibility and resources; begin with people in organizations, corporations, politics and media. The campaign is broken into five main elements: four themes that were the outcome of the LT meeting; the 5th Element, which is comprised of the ongoing efforts at most sites based on the 4 themes. The Four Themes: Community – new audiences: utilize constituencies we haven't heard from – people we haven't connected with –not just in our coastal communities, but in the other parts of the nation. 40th anniversary/pride: Using the anniversary to pointing to what we want to achieve in 10 years; remembering 40, but projecting to 50. Business: business communities are integral to the fabric that makes up sanctuary communities; we depend on them to contribute to the vibrancy of these public places; we contribute to overall ocean health. Existing Communities: give existing communities the sense of urgency necessary to strengthen the sanctuary system. The 5th Element: SBNMS is moving out on getting the sanctuary boundary on weather maps in

the local TV market. MBNMS and Access Monterey Peninsula (AMP) Public Television's collaborative series entitled Your Sanctuary, is off and running. HIHWNMS is partnering with the University of Hawai'i's School of Ocean and Earth Science Technology (SOEST) to expand sanctuary efforts to target ocean users across Hawai'i. CINMS is working with the Maritime Alliance to look for opportunities to continue to build relationships between the sanctuary and military entities. CBNMS is developing a series of short videos that will be offbeat and funny, while still getting the message across that sanctuaries and oceans are special places. PIR and the Waikiki Aquarium have entered into a partnership with Kapiolani Community College to work with the college's tourism industry courses to develop a credited internship. FBNMS seeks to look beyond the territory to identify constituent groups to engage in sanctuary efforts. In particular, the sanctuary will work to engage tour operators and education programs that can continue to bring people and students to American Samoa. **Gilmartin**: NOAA with its proposal to do the critical habitat for monk seals in the main islands has really poisoned the atmosphere here. Going out with a sanctuary promotion sort of media campaign is not the way to go; there is too much opposition in the public. I believe you would want to focus more on trying to work with groups that you believe are interested or groups that you want to get interested. **Wilhelm**: If there is a small group that would be willing to meet to discuss this please let me know. Linda, Uncle Buzzy, Gail and Kem volunteered.

XI. Public Comment

Tarpley: I would love to volunteer to help out with the Oahu Visitors Center. **Johns**: Great, Linda has your contact information.

XII. Further discussion and potential RAC actions related to the day's agenda

Paul: Regarding the wilderness designation letter, I will send a reminder email around to see if anyone has any more questions that you want to ask FWS and we can report back the answers at the next meeting on August 9th. **Johns**: What's the thinking about the ½ day Evaluation Strategy and/or External Review Workshop? **Lowry**: We should know more by the beginning of July if we will need a ½ day. **Byers**: For the Climate Change Strategy Workshop on June 14th, we would like to ask for RAC representatives to attend? **Paul**: I'd like to volunteer for that. **Harp**: Would I be able to come? **Wilhelm**: We will work with you to see about making the arrangements.

Adjourn