

NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE  
**RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Non-Government (Voting)**

Linda Paul (Acting Chair)  
*Conservation*

Rick Gaffney (Acting Vice  
Chair)  
*Recreational Fishing*

Carol Wilcox (Acting Secretary)  
*Conservation*

William Aila, Jr  
*State of Hawai'i*

Pelika Andrade  
*Native Hawaiian*

Bill Gilmartin  
*Research*

Gail Grabowsky  
*Education*

Tammy Harp  
*Native Hawaiian*

Cindy Hunter  
*Research*

Solomon Kaho'ohalahala  
*Native Hawaiian Elder*

Richard Lee  
*Ocean-Related Tourism*

Kem Lowry  
*Citizen-at-Large*

Don Schug  
*Research*

Geoffrey Walker  
*Commercial Fishing*

Jessica Wooley  
*Conservation*

**Government (Non-Voting)**

Athline Clark  
*Papahānaumokuākea MNM*

Jessica Kondel  
*HIHW National Marine Sanctuary*

David W. Laist  
*Marine Mammal Commission*

Michael Lesser  
*National Science Foundation*

Eric Roberts  
*U.S. Coast Guard*

Janice Fukawa  
*U.S. Department of Defense*

Kitty Simonds  
*WESPAC*

Matt Brown  
*U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service*

Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima  
*NOAA Fisheries PIRO*

*Meeting Thursday, October 12, 2017*

*9:00 a.m. – 3:45p.m.*

*NOAA Fisheries PIRO Pier 38,  
Honolulu Harbor Meeting Room Suite 220  
1139 North Nimitz Highway, Honolulu, Hawai'i 96817*

**Meeting Minutes**

**ATTENDEES:**

Voting Members Present: Linda Paul (Conservation, Acting Chair); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing, Acting Vice Chair); Carol Wilcox (Conservation, Acting Secretary); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Cindy Hunter (Research); William Aila, Jr. (State of Hawai'i); Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian); Solomon Kaho'ohalahala (Native Hawaiian Elder); Richard Lee (Ocean-Related Tourism); Jean Kenyon (Research alternate for Gilmartin); Judith Cucco (Conservation alternate for Wooley); Nakoa Goo (Native Hawaiian alternate for Andrade).

Voting Members Absent: Don Schug (Research); Kem Lowry (Citizen-at-Large); Geoff Walker (Commercial Fishing).

Non-Voting Members Present: Rick Hoo (Recreational Fishing Alternate); Eric Roberts (U.S. Coast Guard [USCG]); Athline Clark (Office of National Marine Sanctuaries [ONMS] / Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument [PMNM]); Malia Chow (National Marine Fisheries Service [NMFS]); Mike Marxen (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service [FWS] National Wildlife Refuge System, Pacific Marine National Monuments); Dan Polhemus (FWS Ecological Services [ES]); Janice Fukawa (Department of Defense); Jessica Kondel (ONMS / Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary [HIHWNMS]).

Non-Voting Members Absent: Michael Lesser (National Science Foundation); David Laist (Marine Mammal Commission); Josh DeMello (Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council [Wespac]).

Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument Staff: David Swatland, Alyssa Miller, Nicole Evans, Pua Borges-Smith, Kalani Quiocho, Atsuko Fukunaga, Dr Randall Kosaki, Jon Martinez (ONMS-PMNM); Maria Carnevale (State of Hawai'i, Department of Land and Natural Resources [DLNR] Division of Aquatic Resources [DAR]); Naomi Worchester, Matt Saunter (State of Hawai'i – DLNR Department of Forestry and Wildlife [DOFAW]) by phone.

Members of the Public, Other Agency Members, and Presenters: John Clutter (Aleutian Express Inc.); Dave Delaney (Delaney Aquatic Consulting); Nathan Eagle (Civil Beat); Dave Walin, Kira Fox (Kupu, The Nature Conservancy); Barbara Mayer (public); Lorraine Garnier (public) on phone; Susanne

Spiessberger (public); Vince Johnson, Kerry Abramson, Cory Scott, Julie Rivers (US Navy Pacific Fleet).

#### I. OPENING PROTOCOL (PMNM STAFF)

PMNM staff members opens the meeting with mele *Puka Mai ka Lā* and *Mele No Papahānaumokuākea*.

#### II. ROLL CALL; REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (PAUL)

Acting chair Linda Paul called the meeting to order. There were no changes to the published agenda. A quorum of members was present, and the meeting, having been duly convened, was ready to proceed with business.

Introductions followed. New RAC members William Aila, Jr. (State of Hawai'i) and Jean Kenyon (Research alternate) were introduced. Carol Wilcox was announced as the new Conservation primary seat, Ms. Wilcox previously served as the Conservation alternate.

#### III. REVIEW OF AGENDA AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Paul)

The council approved the meeting minutes from the July 10, 2017 teleconference meeting and the July 13, 2017 meeting.

#### IV. BRIEF REVIEW & SUMMARY PREVIOUS ISSUES, ACTION ITEMS AND STATUS

1. Completed item: Public comment on EO 13795 (Paul): acting chair Linda Paul summarized the public comment letter submitted by the RAC on July 26, 2017 for EO 13795. A copy of the letter was circulated via email, posted on the RAC website, and a hard copy provided at this meeting.

2. Completed item: Visitor Centers (Swatland): PMNM Deputy Superintendent David Swatland presented the RAC members with requested information on rental terms for Mokuāpapa Discovery Center and a spreadsheet on ONMS visitor centers. Both handouts are available on the RAC website.

3. In progress item: sanctuary designation and monument management plan (Clark): PMNM Superintendent Athline Clark discussed with the council that a new Monument Management Plan is required due to expansion area designation, and some management considerations that have emerged since 2008, such as climate change, field camps, species resilience projects, invasive species projects, step-down plans will be addressed. Internal pre-planning is on track, although external planning activities are delayed due to the review process for two April 2017 EO that addressed monuments and national marine sanctuaries. Discussions about potential sanctuary designation are on hold for same reason.

4. In progress item: WesPac Fishing Regulations for Monument Expansion Area: Mr. DeMello was not in attendance, however he sent the following report:  
There is no update. The council deferred action until the completion of President Trump's review of the EO recommendations.

## V. MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE/MANAGEMENT AGENCY UPDATE/HIGHLIGHTS

1. NOAA-ONMS report (Clark): Ms. Clark presented a powerpoint of ONMS highlights from the past few months. Features included: an outline of the Native Hawaiian Plan (a full presentation will be at the Dec 6 RAC/SAC meeting), PMNM participation in the 24<sup>th</sup> annual Hawai'i Conservation Conference, NOAA senior leadership and congressional staff members from the U.S. House and Senate visit NOAA's Inouye Regional Center and Mokupāpapa Discovery Center, Mokupāpapa hosts ONMS's 3rd annual "Get Into Your Sanctuary Day" event, and PMNM scientists discover a large refuge from invasive species in the NWHI. The PowerPoint version of the ONMS presentation, and the full written report, are available on the PMNM website.

2. NOAA-NMFS report (Chow): Malia Chow gave reports from Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center [PIFSC] and Pacific Islands Regional Office [PIRO]. PIFSC: Hawaiian Monk Seal field camp wrapped up in August (5 camps); Hawaiian Islands Cetacean and Ecosystem Assessment Survey [HICEAS] just returned; another cruise upcoming. PIRO: CAPSTONE data from NOAA R/V *Okeanos Explorer* is being analyzed and products are forthcoming. Ms. Clark added that R/V *Falkor* reports are also forthcoming. In addition, a main Hawaiian Island citizen science-monitoring program for Hawaiian green turtle is in progress. Information is online on how to participate.

**NMFS action:** NMFS can provide presentation on HICEAS at an upcoming RAC meeting. A blog is also available online.

**NMFS action:** update on Hawaiian Monk Seal population.

3. State of Hawai'i-DAR report (Carnevale): Maria Carnevale provided the council with a written report on State of Hawai'i update. The council had several questions for Ms. Carnevale the questions resulted in the following action items:

**State of Hawai'i action:** Presentation on Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Recovery Plan update.

**State of Hawai'i action:** Presentation on types of state designations for marine protected areas.

**State of Hawai'i action:** Presentation on community based subsistence fishing areas.

**NMFS action:** Update on shark predation mitigation in NWHI.

4. State of Hawai'i-DOFAW report (Saunter, by phone): Mr. Saunter reported the April-September field season was very productive season. The field season included habitat restoration with native plant outplanting and the *Verbesina encelioides* eradication was highly successful and the Laysan Duck recruitment has been moderate. 20 of 25 Hawaiian Monk Seal pups survived/weaned. Brown Booby colony thriving. DOFAW is working with the Department of Health to eradicate mosquitoes (requires long-term program). Ant eradication continues - semi-annual monitoring for ants (treat if found). No additional rats detected in monitoring efforts. Excavator was safely removed from the lagoon without damage to resources. The marine debris cruise team removed marine debris earlier this year.

5. FWS-Pacific Islands Region (Marxen): Mr. Marxen reported the demobilization of Laysan Island in August -September was successful; Nihoa Monitoring Trip just returned (detailed report coming next quarter); Midway preparing for mouse eradication. Draft EA will available in November 2017 for public comment. USFWS to post decision on EA findings in January.

**FWS action:** Notify RAC when draft EA is published and public comment is open.

6. FWS-Environmental Services (Polhemus): Mr. Polhemus also provided a climate indicators summary update from the PMNM Climate Change Working Group. Features included: 2017 has shown some slight moderation from the successive record hot years of 2015 and 2016, land and ocean temperatures, global sea surface temperatures, predictions on bleaching stress probability, and loss of Arctic sea ice. The presentation is available on the RAC website.

7. Update on enforcement activities (Roberts): No reports on violations. USCG is replacing four vessels in the Pacific. There is no longer a cutter in Hilo. However, two cutters remain in Honolulu. There is no scheduled NWHI surveillance by USCG, only reactive responses, or as add-on to scheduled training or response missions. USCG has been looking at drone technology. Also has access to ship tracking data, with potential opportunities for applications in future.

**RAC action:** Councilmember Rick Gaffney recommends the RAC consider supporting USCG acquisition of NWHI surveillance capabilities.

## VI. BRIEFINGS AND POTENTIAL ACTIONS

1. RAC Work Plan and RAC Subcommittees (Evans): RAC Coordinator Nicole Evans presented a draft work plan for the council. Development of the work plan was included in the council objective and goals in the new adopted charter. The goals of the work plan include: engage RAC members with PMNM programs, PMNM utilize the RAC members' expertise and meetings that are more productive. The process of creating work plans include reviewing existing subcommittees and create new subcommittees, assign ONMS staff liaison, and review other advisory council work plans as examples.

The purpose of this presentation was to familiarize the RAC with the concept of advisory council work plans prior to the RAC/SAC meeting in December 2017.

2. Dec 2017 SAC/RAC meeting agenda items (Clark/Kondel/Paul/Kaho'ohalahala): PMNM Superintendent Athline Clark, Acting HIHWNMS Superintendent Jessica Kondel, acting RAC chair Linda Paul, and SAC chair Sol Kaho'ohalahala. Items include: RAC/SAC briefings to each other (who we are/where we're going/differences), John Armor Talk Story, possible creation of cross council subcommittee to research fund raising opportunities, possible areas of collaboration, Native Hawaiian Plan (ONMS/PMNM Presentation), the Draft Hawaii-Southern California Test and Training Environmental Impact Statement/Overseas EIS Public Comment Letter (Action Item). Potential agenda items will be shared with the SAC leadership. RAC/SAC leadership and ONMS staff will hold a teleconference in November to finalize the agenda.

3. Feedback from Member Selection Subcommittee regarding recruitment in 2017 and 2018 (Evans): RAC Coordinator Nicole Evans discussed the upcoming staggered recruitment. In order

to have a smooth transition under the new term limits, ONMS proposes a phased approach to renew a portion of the seats at a time, beginning with those who have served the longest, until the rotation schedule specified in the charter is met. Members will have the opportunity to reapply for their current seat for one more term.

Currently there are eight councilmembers who have served sixteen years, beyond the maximum term stated in the charter. Feedback from the Member Selection Subcommittee was provided to the Superintendent regarding seats to advertise in 2018 and seats to advertise in 2019.

OMNS consulted those long serving members and several decided to step-down from their seats. Citizen-at-Large Representative Kem Lowry and Research Representative Bill Gilmartin will both step-down. Their seats will be advertised in January 2018 for recruitment. Additionally, the vacant Conservation alternate will be recruited for.

The following seats will be advertised in late 2018 or early 2019 for recruitment: Research Representative Don Schug, Conservation Representative Linda Paul, Recreational Fishing Representative Rick Gaffney, Education Representative Gail Grabowsky, Research Representative Cindy Hunter and Native Hawaiian Representative Tammy Harp.

4. Officer Elections (Evans): Council elections for chair and secretary occurred at the October 12, 2017 RAC meeting. Linda Paul will be remaining as vice-chair for one more year to provide continuity during the transition. Voting members of the RAC were contacted via email for nominations for council chair and secretary. State of Hawai'i Representative William Aila Jr. was nominated for chair and Recreational Fishing Representative Rick Gaffney was nominated for secretary.

Acting chair Linda Paul called for additional nominations. There were no additional nominations.

Selection of candidates for council officer positions is by majority vote of all council members, including the non-voting members, and votes were made by written ballot. Members who were not present at the time of an election submitted their votes in writing to the site superintendent prior to the October 12 meeting.

Term of the chair is two years. The chair may serve a maximum of two consecutive terms (i.e., four years total), if reelected. The term of the council secretary is one year. The council secretary may serve consecutive terms, if reelected.

A ballot was provided in the Councilmembers' handout folder. Ballots were collected, votes tallied over lunch, and officers announced later in the meeting.

## VII. PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment.

## VIII. PRESENTATIONS AND UPDATES

1. The Draft Hawaii-Southern California Test and Training Environmental Impact Statement/Overseas EIS (CAPT Johnson): CAPT Johnson from the US Pacific Fleet joined us in the afternoon for a presentation on the Hawaii-Southern California Training and Testing Environmental Impact Statement/Overseas Environmental Impact Statement (EIS/OEIS). Public meetings will be taking place across the islands next month from 4:00 pm to 8:00 pm on the following dates at the following locations:

- Monday, November 6, 2017:  
Oahu Veterans Center, Fred Ballard Hall, 1298 Kukila St., Honolulu, HI 96818
- Tuesday, November 7, 2017:  
Maui High School, Cafeteria, 660 S. Lono Ave., Kahului, HI 96732
- Wednesday, November 8, 2017:  
Kauai Veterans Center, Main Ballroom, 3215 Kapule Highway, Lihue, HI 96766
- Thursday, November 9, 2017:  
Waiakea High School, Cafeteria, 155 W. Kawili St., Hilo, HI 96720

The Navy is accepting public comment beginning 10/13 for 60 days. The RAC will meet again within these 60 days and plans on commenting as a Council. More information and public comment can be submitted online here: <http://www.hstteis.com/>

The full presentation is available on the RAC website.

2. Preliminary results of Presidential Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 (Swatland): Department of Interior Secretary Zinke recommendations for EO 13792 contained numerous confusing aspects. There were a number of terms for which definitions were not provided, e.g. ‘traditional’ uses. There were four consistent recommendations for terrestrial sites. Only one recommendation for marine areas: lift prohibition on commercial fishing and regulate under Magnuson-Stevens Fishery Conservation and Management Act. Recommendations also included proposals for three new monuments. There were a total of 2.8 million comments, the vast majority of which supported existing monuments. See full report online.

EO 13795 also includes review of sanctuaries. Part of it asks Department of Commerce (DOC) to look at marine monuments and sanctuaries. DOC Secretary recommendations are due on October 25. A total of 99,960 comments were received. Comments were also predominantly positive (in support of monuments and sanctuaries).

What the Trump administration will do with the recommendations is unknown.

3. PMNM RAMP Cruise 2017 (Fukunaga): JIMAR PMNM Ecological Research Statistician Atsuko Fukunaga gave a presentation on the 2017 Reef Assessment and Monitoring Program (RAMP) Cruise. Highlights of the cruise were: Fish and corals in the Monument seemed to be mostly healthy, water was warm, 80-84°F up to Lisianski and 78-79°F at the three northern atolls. There was some coral bleaching, somewhat species specific (*Montipora*, *P. damicornis*, *A. humilis*), but no mass bleaching was observed. The full presentation is available on the RAC website.

4. PMNM 2017 Intertidal Monitoring Cruise (Kosaki): PMNM Deputy Superintendent Dr. Randy Kosaki gave a presentation on the 2017 Intertidal Monitoring Cruise. Highlights of the cruise include: intertidal monitoring of 'opihi and invertebrates (primarily mollusks); 'opihi biology, genetics, reproductive seasonality; intertidal algae and intertidal and shallow subtidal fish surveys. The full presentation is available on the RAC website.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENT

No Public Comment

X. PRESENTATIONS AND UPDATES (CONTINUED)

5. Select 2018 Meeting Dates (Evans): The council selected the following meeting dates for 2018:

- Thursday, March 15, 2018 Location TBD
- Thursday, July 19, 2018 Location TBD
- Thursday, October 11, 2018 Location TBD

6. New Officer Announcements (Evans):

State of Hawai'i Representative William Aila Jr. was elected council chair and Recreational Fishing Representative Rick Gaffney was elected council secretary. They join Vice Chair Linda Paul in the executive leadership team.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.