

NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE
RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL

Non-Government (Voting)

William Aila, Jr (Chair)
State of Hawai'i

Linda Paul (Vice Chair)
Conservation

Rick Gaffney (Secretary)
Recreational Fishing

Pelika Andrade
Native Hawaiian

Gail Grabowsky
Education

Tammy Harp
Native Hawaiian

Cindy Hunter
Research

Solomon Kaho'ohalahala
Native Hawaiian Elder

Jean Kenyon (Acting Primary)
Research

Richard Lee
Ocean-Related Tourism

Don Schug
Research

Geoffrey Walker
Commercial Fishing

Carol Wilcox
Conservation

Jessica Wooley
Conservation

Vacant
Citizen-at-Large

Government (Non-Voting)

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Nikola Garber
HIHW National Marine Sanctuary

Vacant
Marine Mammal Commission

Vacant
National Science Foundation

Eric Roberts
U.S. Coast Guard

Janice Fukawa
U.S. Department of Defense

Kitty Simonds
WESPAC

Matt Brown
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service

Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Meeting March 15, 2018

9:30 a.m. – 4:30 p.m.

NOAA Inouye Regional Center

1845 Wasp Blvd., Bldg. 175, Honolulu, HI 96818

Training Room (1653)

Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES:

RAC Voting Members Present: William Aila Jr. (State of Hawai'i, Chair); Linda Paul (Conservation, Vice-Chair); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing, Secretary); Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian); Jean Kenyon (Research, acting Primary); Solomon Kaho'ohalahala (Native Hawaiian Elder); Pelika Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Phil Fernandez (Commercial Fishing alternate for Walker); Don Schug (Research, by phone); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Jessica Wooley (Conservation, by phone); Carol Wilcox (Conservation); Richard Lee (Ocean-Related Tourism, by phone).

RAC Voting Members Absent: Cindy Hunter (Research).

RAC Non-Voting Members Present: Judith Cucco (Conservation Alternate for Wooley); Nakoa Goo (Native Hawaiian Alternate, by phone); Athline Clark (Office of National Marine Sanctuaries [ONMS] / Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument [PMNM]); Nikola Garber (ONMS/Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary); Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima (National Marine Fisheries Service [NMFS]); Matt Brown, (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service [FWS] National Wildlife Refuge System, Pacific Marine National Monuments); Janice Fukawa (Depart of Defense, US Navy); Eric Roberts (U.S. Coast Guard [USCG]).

RAC Non-Voting Members Absent: Josh DeMello (Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council [WPFMC]).

ONMS Staff: Pua Borges-Smith, Naomi McIntosh, Nicole Evans, Alyssa Miller, Jon Martinez, Allen Tom.

Other Agency Staff: Maria Carnevale (State of Hawai'i, Department of Land and Natural Resources [DLNR] Division of Aquatic Resources [DAR]); Tiare Holm (National Marine Sanctuary Foundation [NMSF]); Meghan Nagle, Mike Marxen (USFWS); Erin Oleson, Stacie Robinson (NMFS).

Members of the Public: Barbara Mayer; Kamal Kapadia, Micah Williams, Amanda - Marie Agustin, Megan Buras, Fay Fujimoto, Koby Tengan, Alyssa Curtis (Punahou School).

I. CALL TO ORDER (Aila Jr.)

Chair William Aila Jr. called the meeting to order. Introductions followed.

II. REVIEW OF AGENDA AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Aila Jr.)

There were no changes to the published agenda. The council approved the meeting minutes from the December 6, 2017 and December 11, 2017 meetings.

III. BRIEF REVIEW & SUMMARY PREVIOUS ISSUES, ACTION ITEMS AND STATUS

1. New member recruitment (Clark/Evans): OMNS advertised for the Citizen-at-Large primary, Citizen-at-Large alternate, Research primary and Conservation alternate seats in February 2018. Applications were received for all seats except Conservation alternate. The Conservation alternate seat will be advertised again. The next steps for the Citizen-at-Large primary, Citizen-at-Large alternate and Research primary seats is for the *Member Selection Subcommittee* to review the applications and provide feedback to ONMS.

2. RAC Action: Public Comment on Draft Hawaii-Southern California Test and Training Environmental Impact Statement/ Overseas EIS (Aila Jr.): On December 12, 2017, the RAC submitted public comment on Draft Hawaii-Southern California Test and Training Environmental Impact Statement/ Overseas EIS. A copy of the public comment was provided to the Council and it is available on the RAC website under *Council Meeting Actions*. The Navy is expecting to have a final document out in October 2018.

3. RAC/SAC Action: Letter to ONMS Director John Armor regarding Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 (Aila Jr.): No change in status. No recommendations on the Executive Orders have been made public. Chair Aila Jr. recommends not moving forward at this time.

4. ONMS Action: Sanctuary designation and monument management plan (Clark): No update. ONMS is not moving forward with the public process until the final recommendations of Executive Orders 13792 and 13795 are released.

5. NMFS action: Update on shark predation mitigation in NWHI (Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima): An update will be given during the Hawaiian Monk Seal 2017 Review by Stacie Robinson later in the agenda.

IV. MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE/MANAGEMENT AGENCY UPDATE/HIGHLIGHTS

1. NOAA-NMFS report (Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima): Update will be included in the NMFS presentations later in the agenda.

2. NOAA-ONMS report (Clark): Ms. Clark presented a powerpoint of ONMS highlights from the past few months. Features included PMNM presence at University of Hawai'i SOEST open house, PMNM featured as a special report in Honolulu Civil Beat, PMNM educators participate in education and outreach meeting in American Samoa and an update on the dive unit safety assessment. The PowerPoint version of the ONMS presentation and the full written report are available on the PMNM website.

3. State of Hawai‘i (Carnevale): Ms. Carnevale provided a written report to the RAC on updates from the State of Hawai‘i Department of Aquatic Resources (DAR). The RAC had several questions regarding the State’s 30x30 Initiative. Ms. Carnevale has since provided the RAC with supplemental information addressing their concerns, that information is included below:

Per the RAC’s request, the steering committee representatives are listed below. As to the other groups proving plan support and public participation opportunities with this planning process, Anne Chung (State of Hawai‘i DAR) offers the following:

For 30x30, the closest group we have to a RAC is the steering committee, we currently don't have a specific group of public representatives.

During the planning process we are reaching out to technical experts to inform spatial data layers and monitoring information, this group would be close to 40 people total but we don't have formal 'committees'

We are in the process of drafting 'guidelines for effective management', which we anticipate vetting through small scale meetings open to the public in spring/summer 2018 but I first need to propose it to the steering committee on 4/10 and finalize our facilitation plan - these guidelines would also be relevant for the Monument as they are general statements/best practices for marine resource management

There will be additional opportunities to participate at the regional level starting in 2019 through interpretation of the spatial analysis maps and through public scoping prior to rulemaking

Name	Organization
Eric Co	Castle Foundation
Matt Ramsey	Conservation International
Bill Walsh	DAR
Brian Neilson	DAR
David Sakoda	DAR
Russell Sparks	DAR
Bruce Anderson	DAR
Suzanne Case	DLNR
Ed Underwood	DOBOR
Chief Farrell/Luna Kekoa	DOCARE
Phil Fernandez	HFACT
Kevin Chang	KUA
Paulo Maurin	NOAA
Wayne Tanaka	OHA
Justine Nihipali	OP
Kim Hum	The Nature Conservancy
Josh DeMello	WESPAC

Additional resources:

Sackett DK, Kelley CD, Drazen JC (2017) Spilling over deepwater boundaries: evidence of spillover from two deepwater restricted fishing areas in Hawaii. *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 568:175-190. <https://doi.org/10.3354/meps12049>

Evaluating the effectiveness of Restricted Fishing Areas for improving the bottomfish fishery in the Main Hawaiian Islands. September 2014. Drazen, J. C., V. Moriwake, D. Sackett, and C. Demarke. University of Hawai'i at Mānoa. (pdf, approx. 15 MB)

<http://dlnr.hawaii.gov/dar/announcements/feasibility-of-a-non-commercial-marine-fishing-registry-permit-or-license-system-in-hawaii>

State of Hawai'i action item: Keep RAC informed on 30x30 Initiative throughout election year. Inform RAC if there is an opportunity for public input or comment. Provide the RAC with information regarding bottomfish closure areas.

The State of Hawai'i report is available on the RAC website.

4. FWS Pacific Islands Region (Brown): Update will be included in Midway Seabird Protection Project Draft Environmental Assessment (EA) presentation later in the agenda.

5. Update on enforcement activities (Roberts): Mr. Roberts provided the RAC with a written report with an update on enforcement activities. From September 2017 – February 2018, there were ten patrols in the U.S. EEZ and in other areas of the Pacific. There were two operations for fishing enforcement activities during this time. To supplement the report, Mr. Roberts provided a fact sheet on the Fast Response Cutter. USCG Hawaii currently has two Fast Response Cutters and will be purchasing a third in 2019.

The written report from USCG is available on the RAC website.

USCG action item: Provide RAC with information on radar surveillance distances for Fast Response Cutters.

6. Presentation of Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS) kapa dpattern (Clark): Ms. Clark presented HIHWNMS Advisory Council Chair Solomon Kaho'ohalahala and HIHWNMS Acting Superintendent Nikola Garber with a kapa pattern to be used by the Sanctuary. Following in the footsteps of Papahānaumokuākea, there are many ways to embody Hawaiian culture into sanctuary programs including the use of kapa patterns to illustrate particular meanings. This design can be used to give the sanctuary a unique and recognizable element that ties it symbolically with the Hawaiian culture. Appropriately used in publications and other outreach materials this kapa design can help convey the uniqueness of the sanctuary and its ties to Hawai'i.

7. RAC/SAC Chair Summit (Aila Jr.): RAC Chair Aila Jr. and HIHWNMS SAC Chair Kaho'ohalahala attended the RAC/SAC Chair Summit in San Francisco, California in January 2018. The agenda for the Summit focused on visitor participation and increasing the number of

visitors to the Sanctuaries. Chair Aila Jr. expressed at the summit that Papahānaumokuākea is unique and we have always stressed, “Bring the Place to the People.” Chair Aila Jr. recommends the RAC brainstorm ways to increase their constituency base and public participation for the Monument and develop advocates.

HIHWNMS Advisory Council Chair Sol Kaho‘ohalahala shared the story from the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary (FKNMS) Advisory Council Chair on how they are now dealing with overexposure and overuse. The FKNMS Council Chair recommends Sanctuaries manage resource properly to deter human destruction.

V. PRESENTATION AND UPDATES

1. Hawaiian Monk Seal 2017 Review (Robinson): Acting Hawaiian Monk Seal Research Program Lead and Research Ecologist Stacie Robinson, Ph.D. gave a presentation on the 2017 Hawaiian Monk Seal season. Highlights include: a two-percent population increase over a 4-year period, a marine debris removal and accumulation study, 376 seals vaccinated in the NWHI with the Morbillivirus vaccination, and a Ke Kai Ola Rehabilitation update. NMFS is leading shark mitigation at French Frigate Shoals. In the 2017 season, there were 42 pups born, six disappeared due to sharks, and sharks injured four pups. On Trig Island, NMFS is putting in a minimal shark fishing effort. A total of 61.5 hours of fishing from shore or boat resulted in one shark removal. Looking ahead, the 2018 research and recovery activities include: population assessment, individual marking, interventions, debris removal and assessment of rehab candidates. The 2018 special projects include a foraging ecology study and unmanned aerial systems. There was some interaction back and forth between Ms. Robinson and the Native Hawaiian Representatives. The Native Hawaiian Representatives expressed continuing concern over implementing protocol and including a cultural monitor.

The full presentation is available on the RAC website.

2. HICEAS 2017 Season Update (Oleson): Erin Olsen from the Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center gave a presentation on the Hawaiian Islands Cetacean and Ecosystem Assessment Survey (HICEAS) 2017. HICEAS 2017 is complete after seven legs spanning 179 days at sea aboard the *Sette & Lasker* from July 6 – December 1, 2017. The data collection goals included density & abundance, population structure & range, ecosystem observations, and ancillary projects. The full presentation is available on the RAC website.

3. Midway Seabird Protection Project Draft EA (Brown): Mr. Brown presented on the Midway Seabird Protection Project draft EA. Below is a link to the website Mr. Brown shared (a warning that there is graphic imagery):

<http://usfwspacific.tumblr.com/post/167063752600/midways-albatross-a-new-threat-puts-the-worlds>

The Midway Seabird Protection Project Draft Environmental Assessment was released March 21, 2018. All relevant comments and information received by April 19, 2018, will be considered. The draft EA is available to view at <https://goo.gl/SYrAeo>.

Public comments on the draft EA can be submitted via email: MidwayEA_comments@fws.gov or mail to: Attn: Midway Draft EA Comments, Pacific Islands Refuges and Monuments Office, 300 Ala Moana Blvd., Room 5-231, Honolulu, HI, 96850

For background on this new threat to albatross: <https://goo.gl/JZrTpV>.
For downloadable photos and video, please visit: <https://goo.gl/JZrTpV>.

VI. PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment.

VII. POTENTIAL ACTIONS

1. RAC Action: Midway Seabird Protection Project Draft Environmental Assessment Public Comment.

Councilmembers developed a set of topics to include in public comment for the draft EA.

Questions for USFWS (since the Draft EA had yet to be released at the time of the meeting, these questions may be answered in the document)

1. The goal is 100% eradication, what happens if this does not occur?
2. What about coastal species? Monk seals, turtles, corals, etc.
3. What is the success rate of similar projects?
4. What is the half-life of the poison?
 - a. *USFWS response at RAC meeting: not currently known, 1-2 months*
5. What are the patterns of “blooms” at other islands?
 - a. *USFWS response at RAC meeting: have looked at other islands, small sample size.*
6. What is the no action and what other alternatives were considered?
 - a. *USFWS response at RAC meeting: Yes, all other feasibility discussed.*
7. Does the draft EA describe biosecurity protocols?
8. Does the draft EA allow eradication to happen in subsequent years? (If the 2019 season is not possible?)
9. How does USFWS define the success of the project?
10. How does USFWS know when there are no mice?
11. This EA only covers this effort – would USFWS have to come back for additional work on Midway?

Comments on the Midway Seabird Protection Project

- RAC supports action to eliminate the mice
- The RAC does not want the mice to come back
- USFWS needs to consider bio-security for emergency landings
- The RAC supports the funding for this effort
- The RAC supports different methods for different parts of the island
- Appreciate that USFWS is partnering with groups who have done this before
- The RAC encourages USFWS to work with groups who have expertise in the community, relations to gain support

- The RAC encourages USFWS to utilize climate comparisons in other areas where this has occurred
- The health of Midway Atoll is culturally important and it is important to bring balance back to Midway Atoll
- The urgency is a protocol
- The RAC encourages USFWS to consider cultural protocol in order to cleanse and restore the balance of the place

RAC action: The Council makes a motion to accept the list of topics developed at the March 15, 2018 meeting related to the Midway Seabird Protection Project Draft Environmental Assessment. The list of topics will be used by the executive committee to develop a public comment. The draft will be circulated to the RAC. The motion is seconded. The Council votes unanimously to accept.

2. RAC action: Councilmember Rick Gaffney recommends the RAC consider supporting USCG acquisition of NWHI surveillance capabilities.

Mr. Gaffney recommends the Council consider supporting the USCG acquisition of NWHI surveillance capabilities. Mr. Roberts supports moving forward with the letter and expanding the request for support beyond USCG. Mr. Gaffney will draft a letter with the recommendation and present it at the next RAC meeting in July 2018.

VIII. RAC WORK PLANS

Ms. Evans presented a draft work plan for the council. Development of the work plan is included in the council objective and goals in the newly adopted charter. The goals of the work plan include: engage RAC members with PMNM programs, PMNM utilize the RAC members' expertise and meetings that are more productive. The process of creating work plans include reviewing existing subcommittees and create new subcommittees, assign ONMS staff liaison, and review other advisory council work plans as examples.

RAC action: The Council makes a motion that the RAC *Planning, Evaluation and Sanctuary Nomination Process Working Group* become a subcommittee. The motion is seconded. The Council votes unanimously to establish the *Planning, Evaluation and Sanctuary Nomination Process Subcommittee*.

The RAC work plan will be an agenda item at subsequent meetings and there will be time for subcommittees and working groups to breakout. The subcommittees and working groups that will breakout are the *Planning, Evaluation and Sanctuary Nomination Process Subcommittee*, the *Education and Outreach Working Group* and the *Research Subcommittee*.

The next step for the work plan is to develop the objectives & goals and identify areas of interest for the subcommittees and working groups. The *Member Selection Subcommittee* will not have a designated breakout time at the RAC meetings. The primary work for that subcommittee is done via email and phone. In addition, the *Joint RAC/SAC Working Group* will be meeting at separate times to include SAC members.

Primaries, alternates, and non-voting members are invited to participate on subcommittees. Primaries, alternates, non-voting members, other Advisory Council members and members of the public are invited to participate on working groups. Councilmembers not in attendance at this RAC meeting were asked to notify the RAC coordinator if they are interested in participating.

The RAC also discussed the *Council Administration and Operations* and *Member Selection Subcommittee* draft work plans. These work plans are open to all member suggestions. This serves as an example of how to flesh out the work plans for the Subcommittees and Working Groups. These are living documents and are constantly being updated. The draft work plans are available on the RAC website.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENT

National Marine Sanctuary Foundation Hawai'i Director Tiare Holm made public comment on her desire to collaborate and work with the Council.

Ms. Holm explained the recent transitions with NMSF. The Foundation is evaluating whether a chapter model is best for Hawai'i or if a *hui* modality may be a better fit. The Foundation exists to support Sanctuaries and is committed to that purpose. The Foundation provides services as a strong NGO partner.

Ms. Holm has experience working in Micronesia and discussed her involvement with a program similar to the State of Hawaii's 30x30 Initiative. It is important to determine what effective management looks like and get a baseline.

Ms. Holm is willing to work with the RAC members who have expressed a desire for a visitor center on Oahu and the idea of bringing the place to the people.

X. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:30 p.m.