

NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE
RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL

Non-Government (Voting)

William Aila Jr. (Chair)
State of Hawai'i
Linda Paul (Vice Chair)
Conservation
Rick Gaffney (Secretary)
Recreational Fishing
Solomon Kaho'ohalahala
Native Hawaiian Elder
Halealoha Ayau
Native Hawaiian
Pelika Andrade
Native Hawaiian
Bonnie Kahape'a-Tanner
Education
VACANT
Commercial Fishing
Mark Hixon
Research
Don Schug
Research
Jean Kenyon
Research
Richard Lee
Ocean-Related Tourism
Kanoë Morishige
Conservation
Audrey Newman
Conservation
Judith Cucco
Citizen-at-Large

Government (Non-Voting)

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM
Allen Tom
*Hawaiian Islands
Humpback Whales NMS*
Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima
NOAA Fisheries PIRO
Brandon Jim On
NOAA OLE
Brad Kaalelo Wong
Office of Hawaiian Affairs
Maile Norman
U.S. Coast Guard
Janice Fukawa
U.S. Department of Defense
Joshua DeMello
WPRFMC
Dan Polhemus
*U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
- Ecological Services*
Jared Underwood
*U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
- Refugees*
Brian Neilson
State of Hawai'i - DLNR

Meeting March 24, 2021

9:00am – 1:00pm

Via GoToWebinar

Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES:

RAC Voting Members Present: William Aila Jr. (State of Hawai'i, Chair); Pelika Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Judith Cucco (Citizen-At-Large); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing, Secretary); Mark Hixon (Research); Bonnie Kahape'a-Tanner (Education); Sol Kaho'ohalahala (Native Hawaiian Elder); Jean Kenyon (Research); Rick Lee (Ocean-Related Tourism); Audrey Newman (Conservation); Linda Paul (Conservation, Vice-Chair); and Don Schug (Research).

RAC Voting Members Absent: Halealoha Ayau (Native Hawaiian) and Kanoë Morishige (Conservation).

RAC Non-Voting Members Present: Thorne Abbott (Conservation Alternate); Paul Badgley (Ocean-Related Tourism Alternate); Jennifer Barrett (Citizen-At-Large Alternate); Doug Fetterly (Conservation Alternate); Nakoā Goo (Native Hawaiian Alternate); Heather Howard (Education Alternate); Haunani Kane (Research Alternate); Neal Langerman (Research Alternate); Bob Leinau (Conservation Alternate); Bill Walsh (Research Alternate); Athline Clark (NOAA/ONMS-PMNM); Brandon Jim On (NOAA/NMFS-OLE); Brian Neilson (State of Hawai'i/DLNR-DAR); Cynthia Vanderlip (State of Hawai'i/DLNR-DOFAW); Cindy Among-Serrao (NOAA/ONMS-HIHWNMS); Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima (NOAA/NMFS-PIRO); Janice Fukawa (USDOD-USN); Joshua DeMello (WPRFMC); Maile Norman (USCG); Dan Polhemus (USFWS-ES); Jared Underwood (USFWS-NWR); and Amanda Boyd (USFWS-NWR).

RAC Non-Voting Members Absent: Shad Kane (Native Hawaiian Elder Alternate); Rick Hoo (Recreational Fishing Alternate); Brad Wong (OHA); Allen Tom (NOAA/ONMS-HIHWNMS).

ONMS Leadership and Staff: Kristina Kekuewa (ONMS Regional Director, Pacific Island Region), Eric Roberts (ONMS-PMNM Deputy Superintendent). Staff: Alyssa Miller, Andy Collins, Jenny Crawford, Justin Umholtz, Kalani Quiocho, Malia Evans, Virginia Branco, Brian Hauk, Kahi Fujii, Phillip Howard, Randy Kosaki, Jason Leonard, Clayton Watkins, and Kevin Kinvig.

Members of the Public: Jeff Bagshaw, Sheryl Bryner, Fern Duvall, Ann Garrett, Gail Grabowsky, Roxane Keli'ikipikāneokolohaka, Ekolu Lindsey, Barbara Mayer, Jim Pieri, Wayne Sentman, Michelle Smith, Jeff Walters, Edward Lindelof, Rose Criscione, Peter Landon, Hau'oli Lorenzo-Elarco, and Heather Ylitalo-Ward.

I. CALL TO ORDER (Paul)

Vice-Chair Paul called the meeting to order. Protocol, roll call and introductions followed. A short orientation of the Go To Webinar platform and interface done by PMNM staff.

II. APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES (Paul)

Representative Cucco moved to accept the minutes, and Representative Newman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the minutes were adopted.

III. BRIEF REVIEW & SUMMARY: PREVIOUS ISSUES, ACTION ITEMS AND STATUS

1. Introducing new RAC members

- a. Bonnie Kahapea-Tanner, Education Representative Primary
- b. Mark Hixon, Ph.D, Research Representative Primary
- c. Doug Fetterly, Conservation Representative Alternate
- d. Bill Walsh, Ph.D, Research Representative Alternate
- e. Haunani Kane, Ph.D, Research Representative Alternate
- f. Neal Langerman, Ph.D, Research Representative Alternate
- g. Paul Badgley Jr., Ocean-Related Tourism Representative Alternate

For more information on newly appointed members, visit

<https://www.papahanaumokuakea.gov>.

2. State of Hawai'i Action: Keep RAC informed on the *30 x 30 Initiative*. Update deferred to DLNR agency update.
3. ONMS Action: Keep RAC informed of NFWF funding and activities. Update deferred to ONMS agency update.
4. NMFS Action: Keep RAC informed of any changes to the Magnuson-Stevens Fishery Conservations and Management Act. No updates.

IV. MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE/MANAGEMENT AGENCY UPDATES

1. NOAA-ONMS (Clark): See PowerPoint presentation and written report archived at PMNM RAC website.

The Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve virtually celebrated its 20th Anniversary on December 4, 2020. A series of short videos were interspersed with a panel discussion featuring past and present Superintendents and RAC members.

2. NOAA-NMFS (Ka'aekuahiwi-Pousima):

The Marianas MNM draft management plan and EIS NOI was released for public comment until May 25, 2021. View or download the document at [regulations.gov](https://www.regulations.gov). If any questions, feel free to reach out. <https://www.fisheries.noaa.gov/action/notice-availability-marianas-trench-marine-national-monument-draft-management-plan-and>

Research season: The Pacific Islands Science Center is planning to hold FY21 field camps for most programs including Hawaiian monk seals, turtles, and habitat management.

3. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Services – Refuges (Boyd): See PowerPoint presentation archived at PMNM RAC website.

Midway Atoll: Has a new Refuge manager on site. Pam Repp arrived in February 2021. The Dec/Jan annual albatross count was successful, having a shorter than usual duration with fewer people. The short-tailed albatross pair returned and is nesting, its' chick hatched on New Year's day and is healthy. This is the pair's third chick that has successfully fledged; and two of the previous chicks (juveniles) have been seen returning to Midway Atoll. Partnership with Pacific Rim Conservation continues. This year successful translocations were done on O'ahu as well as Guadalupe island in Mexico. Translocation partnership also includes DOFAW (more eggs were translocated to Ka'ena). Some albatrosses banded at Guadalupe showed up at Midway Atoll this year. Habitat restoration continues; planted lots of *Solanum nelsonii* (*pōpolo*), *Eragrostis*

variabilis (kawelu), *Sida fallax ('ilima)*, and other natives. First monk seal pup of the year was born on January 19th at Spit Island and has successfully weaned. The mouse eradication project has been postponed until 2022 due to logistical constraints and uncertainties associated with the pandemic. See additional updates from Friends of Midway Atoll NWR at <https://www.facebook.com/FriendsofMidwayNWR> and PMNM's Facebook page <https://www.facebook.com/Papahanaumokuakea>.

Nihoa: FWS received an invasive species grant to remove invasive *Cenchrus echinatus (spiny sandbur)*. The team plans to visit in May and September 2021 to control *Cenchrus* in multiple sites. Monitoring cameras were placed around the island to monitor growth and seed productions; pre-emergent was applied in some seed areas. Challenges associated with burrowing seabirds remain. Managers are keeping trips short and training/preparing those who work on the island in order to minimize disturbance.

Tern Island, FFS/Lalo: The Lalo Working Group has restarted and is working with EPA to clean up contaminants on Eastern Island and Walaka damage from 2018. In the future, FWS hopes to repair the seawall and restore wildlife habitat at Tern Island.

4. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Services – Ecological Services (Polhemus): See Hawai'i Climate Change Indicators presentation archived at PMNM RAC website. NOAA launched its newest forecast model last week. American Global Forecast Model (GFS-16.0) improved features include better ability to track hurricane tracks and intensities. NOAA climate data remain available to the public (via NOAA portals). Getting more user-friendly.
5. State of Hawai'i DLNR-DAR (Neilson): 30 x 30 Initiative – The 30 x 30 Roadmap (rollout plan) has been released and is available at the DLNR website at

https://dlnr.hawaii.gov/dar/files/2020/12/HolomuaMarine30x30_Roadmap_web.pdf

Current actions include: Continuation of statewide scoping meetings and consultations for herbivore management. Ten scoping meeting have been held, including fisher meetings, with additional meetings being scheduled for 2021. There has been a lot of participation and good feedback received so far.

Place-Based Planning: Community partners are key in herbivore management and restoration efforts. DAR is working to further expand opportunities for community engagement in those stewardship projects and is moving forward with several community sites. DAR is seeking feedback for proposed rules for Miloli'i and West Hawai'i CBSFAs in 2021 meetings. Scoping and/or discussions are on-going for proposed management areas at Kīpahulu, Mo'omomi, and Maunaloa Bay. Pūpūkea FMA expansion to include tidepools is underway.

Review of Biden Executive Order on Climate: State is conducting a review to identify connections to and implications for the Hawai'i 30 x 30 Initiative.

30 x 30 Planning & Evaluation: Hawai'i has 59 managed areas, representing approximately 6% of the total state marine area. Most lack management plans, so they are difficult to evaluate for effectiveness. DLNR is working drafting management plans for managed areas to identify priority management actions and enable evaluation. DAR will be seeking input on the plans from cultural experts, fishers, scientists, and others. The 30 x 30 website was expanded and more targeted outreach is planned this summer including meetings.

6. State of Hawai'i DLNR-DOFAW (Vanderlip): See written report archived at PMNM RAC website. DOFAW seeks volunteer crew and field camp leaders for the upcoming summer 2021 Kure field season. See the announcement with description on the KAC website at <http://www.kureatollconservancy.org/>
7. USCG (Norman): See written report archived at PMNM RAC website. Accomplishments included over 180 boater education interactions which provided information on state and federal regulations in place to protect humpback whales in the sanctuary and surrounding waters.

V. Education and Outreach Working Group Meeting (Cucco)

1. The working group met on February 16, 2021 to review the Education and Outreach Work Plan. The four topical areas are Communities, Visitor Centers, Media, and ONMS Outreach & Education. The current high priority actions were identified as follows:
 - a. Communities:
 - i. Provide input to staff on community engagement regarding National Marine Sanctuary
 - ii. Identify new potential stakeholders and expand volunteer members
 - iii. Expand science and culture in the classroom
 - iv. Provide outreach on all islands and engage RAC members on all islands in outreach
 - b. Visitor Centers:
 - i. Support MDC staff and help with development of key messaging
 - c. Media: Currently, there are no high priority items.
 - d. ONMS O & E
 - i. Support ONMS as needed for anniversaries, NMS designation, etc.
2. The working group still needs a Chair.

VI. SANCTUARY DESIGNATION SUBCOMMITTEE WORK (Clark and Roberts) See PowerPoint presentation archived at PMNM RAC website.

1. The RAC sent a letter to ONMS Director John Armor expressing support for the NMS designation process. Mr. Armor sent a response confirming ONMS' commitment to the process.
2. There have been three directives (presidential and congressional) to designate a NMS. The onus for shepherding this process is ONMS (one of the 7 co-managing agencies of PMNM). The directives are that designation is for waters, not terrestrial areas, and that a sanctuary will supplement and complement rather than supplant existing authorities. The designations will build on the Monument's resource protection framework, and will not change the Monument co-management structure or existing joint-permitting process. Benefits of a sanctuary include the ability to assess civil penalties and provide for additional consultation by federal agencies. It provides permanency, enhanced protections for Hawaiian monk seal, green sea turtle, and seabird foraging areas, cetaceans, coral reefs, and seamounts. It also provides an opportunity for the RAC to become a SAC.
3. Early stages of the process include submitting a NMSA 304(a)(5) package to the Regional Fisheries Management Council, providing an opportunity for the council to make a determination on an action for fisheries regulations. Once all these pre-planning actions are done, a public scoping period will occur. Timeline is dependent on the initial discussions with co-managing partners, and how the merging of management planning components is determined.
4. The RAC can assist through the RAC subcommittees. If interested in serving, please contact Jennifer Crawford. Primary and Alternatives may serve, as may non-voting members.

Discussion:

Representative Schug noted that in the recent Supreme Court decision regarding New England Canyons NMS, Justice Roberts' opinion addressed the size and function of monuments, and that this decision and opinion will likely be raised during a sanctuary designation process. The EIS for the sanctuary will require that the impacts of a range of alternatives be evaluated. Those alternatives will likely include various sanctuary boundaries.

Representative Walsh asked if fishing regulations recommended by the regional fishery council can't be less restrictive than those already in effect in the Monument. This was affirmed by Superintendent Clark.

Representative Paul inquired if the Sanctuary subcommittee should be a committee of the whole; Representative Newman stated that a committee of the whole may be too cumbersome for a working committee.

Representative Schug asked about the Research subcommittee status. Superintendent Clark replied that the subcommittee would be reactivated with all the new research seats on the RAC and any others who are interested in being engaged, and a meeting scheduled before the next RAC meeting.

VII. UPCOMING RAC/SAC MEETING ON APRIL 2, 2021 (Kaho‘ohalahala) Representative Kaho‘ohalahala and SAC Representative Roxane Keli‘ikipikāneokolohaka provided information on the upcoming April 2, 2021 joint meeting concerning whale strandings.

1. Whales are especially significant to Native Hawaiians, who want to be participants in management. Native Hawaiian groups have made attempts to work with NMFS on this issue with sometimes negative results. Individuals have been treated like criminals.
2. The HIHWNMS SAC is highlighting the need to discuss the cultural aspects of whales and of the end of life of whales, including koholā (as the focal species of the HIHWNMS). The Hūhūli subcommittee of the SAC is working to achieve this and has drafted a letter to NMFS with a set of questions for NMFS to respond to. Representative Kaho‘ohalahala invited the RAC to attend a meeting that was hosted by the SAC that would further address this issue.

Discussion

Jeff Walters, NMFS, noted that strandings of koholā are relatively rare in the main Hawaiian islands, and also (insofar as known) in the NWHI. No criminal charges have been levied against individuals in strandings, only civil charges.

Representative Andrade stated that the legal process put Native Hawaiians in a position that they shouldn't have been in. Native Hawaiians role in management should be enlarged and future discussions should be focused on how this can happen.

SAC Representative Roxane Keli‘ikipikāneokolohaka stated that collective stewardship is needed. No single entity can do this on its own. We need to remember and support the role of the community in these efforts. Data needs to be available to communities, e.g. Kaua‘i and Maui communities where there have been mass strandings.

VIII. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

No public comments were provided.

IX. 20TH ANNIVERSARY OF THE NWHI CRER ADVISORY COUNCIL – FEBRUARY 2021 (Roberts and Collins)

The first RAC meeting was held on February 16, 2001. Mr. Collins shared a video commemorating the RAC. Please also see the RAC profiles posted at <https://www.papahanaumokuakea.gov/new-about/council/profiles/>

X. DECISION-MAKING, WRAP-UP, CLOSING REMARKS

Action – Remove E.O review as standing agenda item (Paul)

Representative Newman stated her agreement to remove the item, however as an author of the letter, noted the wealth of information included in the letter and its supporting documents and recommended keeping these available as background information for RAC members.

Superintendent Clark stated that the documents can be readily referenced on the website and that ONMS can provide links.

Vice-Chair Paul stated that the item will removed from the agenda.

2021 MEETING DATES

April 2, 2021 – Joint RAC/SAC Meeting

June 30, 2021

September 22, 2021