

NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE
RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL

Non-Government (Voting)

William Ailā, Jr. (Chair)
State of Hawai'i

Linda Paul (Vice Chair)
Conservation

Rick Gaffney (Secretary)
Recreational Fishing

Pelika Andrade
Native Hawaiian

Kalama'ehu Takahashi
Native Hawaiian

Nakoa Goo
Native Hawaiian Alternate

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Native Hawaiian Elder

Audrey Newman
Conservation

Samuel 'Ohu Gon III
Conservation

Robert Leinau
Conservation Alternate

Doug Fetterly
Conservation Alternate

Thorne Abbott
Conservation Alternate

Don Schug
Research

Haunani Kane
Research

Mark Hixon
Research

Neal Langerman
Research Alternate

William Walsh
Research Alternate

Richard Lee
Ocean-Related Tourism

Paul Badgley
Ocean-Related Tourism Alternate

Bonnie Kahapea-Tanner
Education

Heather Howard
Education Alternate

Judith Cucco
Citizen-at-Large

Kammie Dominique-Tavares
Citizen-at-Large Alternate

Vacant
Commercial Fishing
Commercial Fishing Alternate
Native Hawaiian Elder Alternate

Government (Non-Voting)

Athline Clark
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Kim Hum
HIHW National Marine Sanctuary

Malia Chow
NOAA Fisheries PIRO

Brandon Jimon

November 18, 2022
9:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.
Via Google Meet Teleconference
Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES:

RAC Voting Members Present: William Ailā (Council Chair), Don Schug (Research), Mark Hixon (Research), Rick Gaffney (Secretary and Recreational Fishing), Linda Paul (Vice Chair and Conservation), Samuel 'Ohu Gon III (Conservation), Haunani Kane (Research), Solomon Kaho'ohalahala (Native Hawaiian Elder Primary), Judith Cucco (Citizen-at-Large), Holden Kalama'ehu Takahashi (Native Hawaiian), and Richard Lee (Ocean-Related Tourism Acting Primary)

RAC Voting Members Absent: Audrey Newman (Conservation), Pelika Andrade (Native Hawaiian), and Bonnie Kahapea-Tanner (Education Primary)

RAC Non-Voting Members Present: Nakoa Goo (Native Hawaiian alternate), Doug Fetterly (Conservation alternate), Thorne Abbott (Conservation alternate), Kammie Dominique-Tavares (Citizen-at-Large alternate), Neal Langerman (Research alternate), William Walsh (Research alternate), Paul Badgley (Ocean-Related Tourism alternate), Heather Howard (Education alternate), Brian Neilson (DLNR-DAR), Dan Polhemus (USFWS), Joshua DeMello (WPRFMC), Janice Fukawa (USDOD), Malia Chow (NOAA-NMFS), Cindy Among-Serrao (ONMS-HIHWNMS), Kim Hum (ONMS-HIHWNMS), Brandon Jimon (NOAA-OLE), Kealoha Pisciotta (OHA)

RAC Non-Voting Members Absent: Robert Leinau (Conservation alternate), and Rick Hoo (Recreational Fishing alternate)

ONMS Staff and Others Present: Eric Roberts (ONMS-PMNM), Alyssa Miller (ONMS-PMNM), Kalani Quiocho (ONMS-PMNM), Kanoe Morishige (ONMS-PMNM), Jason Leonard (ONMS-PMNM), Pua Borges (NOAA-NMFS-PIRO), Phillip Howard (ONMS-PMNM), Silvia Hussey (OHA), James Morioka (Presenter), Athline Clark (Public), and Tammy Harp (Public)

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

Welcome (Ailā, Jr.)

The meeting opened with a welcome by Chair Ailā, and an opening protocol conducted by Kanoë Morishige.

Roll call, Introductions, Review and Approval of Agenda (Ailā, Jr.)

Roll call was taken by Catherine Takata.

Review and approval of the agenda was conducted by Chair Ailā.

Representative Paul moved to accept the agenda, and Representative Cucco seconded the motion. The agenda was adopted unanimously.

Review & approval of August 31, 2022 Meeting Minutes (Ailā, Jr.)

Review and approval of the meeting minutes were conducted by Chair Ailā. Representative Paul moved to accept the minutes as amended, and Representative Gaffney seconded the motion. The minutes for the August 31 meeting were adopted unanimously.

Overview of Chair, Vice Chair, and Secretary election process (Catherine Takata)

PMNM staff gave a brief description of the Chair, Vice Chair, and Secretary officer positions that were available for nomination. They gave a short tutorial on the virtual election process using the poll feature in Google Meet.

Review & Summary of Previous Issues, Action Items and Status (Eric Roberts)

1. State of Hawaii Action: Keep RAC informed on *30x30 Initiative*
 - Holomua 30x30 conducted two successful talk story sessions in Maui, with the objective to share information about the initiative, goals, and process. The State seeks to gain input from Maui community members about issues they are seeing in their nearshore waters in terms of aquatic resources.
 - The State is asking to nominate members (20) to a planning team as they develop a islands navigation team:
 - The current objective is to develop a plan for Maui as they identify potential marine and fishing objectives so DAR can determine scoping and rule making process.
 - Currently in the second phase of process:
 - Piloting it on Maui first to determine what works best and what does not.
 - Statewide Basis and Update:
 - The Board of Natural Resources is establishing new rules affecting lay nets and gill nets. They are awaiting signage for finalization.
 - There is an emergency rule affecting ballast water in an attempt to prevent stoney coral tissue loss disease as it relates to shipping.
2. ONMS Action: Keep RAC informed of NFWF funding and activities
 - There are currently no resource proposals out for solicitation for NFWF funding which is typically something we see from time to time with research associated with Papahānaumokuākea MNM.

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

3. NMFS Action: Keep RAC informed of any changes to the Magnuson-Stevens Fishery Conservation and Management Act
 - Magnuson-Stevens Fishery Conservation and Management Act has been marked up but nothing has come out of committee yet. (Malia Chow)
 - The revised Coral Reef Conservation Act is attached to a bill that is very likely to pass. (Dan Polhemus)

Monument Co-Trustee/Management Agency Updates/Highlights

- NOAA Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (Eric Roberts)
 - Mokupāpapa Discovery Center (MDC) welcomed 6523 visitors to the facility, and worked with 98 high school and middle school students representing two local and two international schools.
 - PMNM celebrated the 30th anniversary of the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary and the 50th anniversary of national marine sanctuaries.
 - The US Coral Task Force Management Fellows team of the 45th US Coral Task Force (USCTF) meeting in Kailua-Kona joined MDC staff for an in-depth exploration of science communication, community outreach, and coral-related teaching resources.
 - NOAA Global Monitoring Laboratory (GML) program directors visited Hawai'i Island to visit the NOAA atmospheric facilities and MDC to talk about future exhibit partnerships to highlight NOAA's climate and atmospheric research.
 - On August 31, the Reserve Advisory Council (RAC) for the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHICRER) held a virtual meeting with forty people in attendance. Council members heard a presentation from the Planning, Evaluation, and Sanctuary Designation (PES) Subcommittee on their recommendations for the Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council's (WPRFMC) draft fishing regulations for sanctuary designation.
 - On September 15, as part of the National Marine Sanctuaries Webinar Series and the Mokupāpapa Third Thursday by the Bay Lecture Series, Hōkūokahalelani Pihana, Executive Director of Nā Wa'a Mauō Marine Stewardship Program; Kainalu Steward, Ph.D. student at Arizona State University; and J. Hau'oli Lorenzo-Elarco, Instructor of Hawaiian Language at Honolulu Community College shared their experiences developing a partnership with the Ocean Exploration Trust (OET) during deep ocean mapping and exploration within PMNM and Johnston Atoll.
 - ONMS Director John Armor and Special Assistant Michelle Burt visited Mokupāpapa Discovery Center (MDC) to receive updates on MDC's new exhibits and partnerships, get briefed on the sanctuary designation progress for PMNM by Acting Superintendent Eric Roberts, and meet with the Office of Hawaiian Affairs (PMNM Co-trustee), ONMS Pacific Islands Region staff Kristina Kekuewa, Kalani Quiocho, and Hoku Ka'aekuahiwi Pousima.

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- PMNM research ecologist Randy Kosaki gave a presentation to, and fielded questions from, 10th and 11th grade students at Maui Preparatory Academy staged by DreamWakers.
- Dr. Lance Morgan of the Marine Conservation Institute (MCI) presented the Blue Parks award to the co-managers of Papahānuamokuakea. In 2017, Papahānuamokuakea was one of three inaugural Blue Parks award winners, an award designed to celebrate effective MPAs and incentivize governments, managers, communities and leaders to achieve effective conservation.
- On September 30, PMNM and Pacific Islands Regional staff gave a fond farewell to Athline Clark as she completed 25 years of dedicated service to the northwestern Hawaiian Islands, and seven years with ONMS as the site superintendent.
- Mokuapāpapa Discovery Center has been partnering with the University of Hawai‘i at Hilo and their Multiscale Environmental Graphical Analysis (MEGA) laboratory to build out a community science space within the center to connect the public with cutting edge research and researchers, hold events that engage the public with the marine realm, and provide local mentors for students so that they can see themselves pursuing careers in marine related fields.
- PMNM staff participated in the first Annual Mālama Pu‘uloa Festival to raise awareness about the vital importance of Pu‘uloa (Pearl Harbor), and celebrate the ways in which communities and partners have come together to steward and restore its biocultural resources.
- On October 20, as part of the National Marine Sanctuaries Webinar Series and the Mokuapāpapa Third Thursday by the Bay Lecture Series, Hōkūokahalelani Pihana, Executive Director of Nā Wa‘a Mauō Marine Stewardship Program, Allison Funds, Chief Operating Officer with Ocean Exploration Trust, and Daniel Wagner, Chief Scientist with Ocean Exploration Trust discussed the three telepresence-enabled expeditions aboard E/V Nautilus to explore never-before-surveyed areas within the Papahānuamokuakea Marine National Monument.
- PMNM Sanctuary Resource Specialist Brian Hauk and Vessel Operations Coordinator LTJG Luke Evancoe gave four 45-minute presentations to 80+ students at Waipahu Intermediate School’s Career Fair.
- Downtown Hilo was packed Friday, November 5, as thousands of people joined the annual Black and White Night celebrations for the first time since the pandemic started. Mokuapāpapa welcomed 1209 people for hula, honey tasting, games, and a jazz and blues concert to benefit East Hawai‘i Veterans!
- On November 1, Megan Kroning from the Evaluation Team at the Exploratorium in San Francisco presented a training on exhibit evaluation for Hilo Museums to practice evaluating exhibits.
- Scientists from PMNM, Bishop Museum, and Univ. of Hawai‘i assessed the comparative phylogeography of three shallow and two MCE (deep reef) squirrel fishes in the family Holocentridae to publish the first multi-species analysis of mesophotic phylogeography.

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- The Papahānaumokuākea Marine Debris Project (PMDP) returned from a 30 day at sea mission collecting derelict fishing gear and debris from the reefs and shores of Papahānaumokuākea.
- PMNM Field Team participated in classroom and field training for large whale entanglement response to focus on safety, equipment, roles, and chain of command which is critical in responding to these large animals.
- LTJG Luke Evancoe, PMNM's Vessel Operations Coordinator, was selected to the 2022 Class of Sustainability, Energy, and Environmental (SEE) Ambassadors and recognized at a virtual awards ceremony.
- Acting Superintendent Eric Roberts, along with USFWS Deputy Superintendent Amanda Boyd, and NOAA Pacific Islands Region Collaboration Team Coordinator Pua Kamaka, hosted a roundtable discussion with the State Department's International Visitors Leadership Program QUAD partners (i.e. Australia, Japan, India).
- ONMS/NOAA, the National Park Service, the University of Hawai'i Sea Grant program, and a NOAA Hawai'i Climate Change Teacher Fellow attended a week-long NASA Climate Communication Earth to Sky Academy to gain training on climate change.
- From October 11 through November 17, Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument representatives staffed education and outreach displays during the Office of Hawaiian Affairs Developing OHA's Ocean Policy statewide public meetings.
- NOAA Fisheries PIRO (Malia Chow)
 - ONMS HQ visited Mokuapapa and left with a newfound sense of sanctuaries vs. monuments and the potential to support the expansion of the Pacific Remote Islands.
 - Pacific Islands Fishery Center
 - The Hawaiian Monk Seal study concluded its 2022 field season, which included collecting data and writing an annual population report.
 - The results of the study might be of interest for a future RAC meeting presentation.
 - The Center is considering a pilot effort of conducting field camps every other year in partnership with other entities, instead of conducting annual field camps.
 - The effort is under discussion but moving forward . It would exclude French Frigate Shoals since field camps should continue there, annually.
- USFWS Refuges
 - N/A
- USFWS Ecological Services (Dan Polhemus)
 - Climate Update
 - 2022 will end up being slightly warmer than 2021, with this past October being the fifth warmest October ever.

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- La Niña patterns keep the region generally cool as air and sea temperatures cool near the Big Island and warm up into the Monument.
- Hawai'i is much warmer than we would normally be (by a couple degrees C).
- Precipitation
 - The summer has been a dry season. However, we are still within a La Niña pattern so we should expect to see some more rain.
 - The lack of precipitation is not local as the North America continent is record dry in a lot of ways.
 - The NW Pacific is experiencing high heat and a dry summer this year, which is running right through the Monument.
- Sea Surface Temperature
 - Temperatures are warming up in the monument and normalizing toward the main islands.
- Questions:
 - Linda Paul: What does the high heat do to the albatross or other birds?
 - Dan: The water higher temperatures could alter bird foraging patterns causing them to fly farther than necessary.
- State of Hawai'i DLNR - DAR (Brian Neilson)
 - See update above.
- State of Hawaii DLNR-DOFAW (Cynthia Vanderlip)
 - Kure Atoll
 - The field team was switched out in late October.
 - The Kure Atoll Conservancy applied to National Fish and Wildlife Service Foundation and received:
 - \$150,000 for a year to help employ and maintain the leaders in the field.
 - An extended request to total two years
 - The team will monitor albatross and continue the eradication process of invasive species.
 - The atoll has received 22 inches of rain so far but this is expected to increase 10 more inches.
 - Recently, there tends to be longer dry periods and high rain.
- Office of Hawaiian Affairs (Kealoha Pisciotta)
 - OHA is working on community gatherings across islands with Moloka'i and Hawai'i Island finished this week.
 - These sessions are an opportunity to talk to community members and determine successes and challenges as ocean users to inform OHA's ocean policy going forward.
 - They have collected a lot of powerful information and ongoing challenges.
 - OHA thanks NOAA for accompanying and answering questions

**Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING**

**Papahānaumokuākea Marine Debris Program 2022: Marine Debris Mitigation
Accomplishments in Papahānaumokuākea Presentation (James Morioka)**

- James Morioka, Executive Director of Papahānaumokuākea Marine Debris Program (PMDP) shared PMDP’s 2022 highlights and accomplishments upon return of their most recent exhibition into the Monument. PMDP is a U.S. 501(c)(3) non-profit organization created to protect the sensitive wildlife and critical habitats of the Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands) from the threats of marine debris.
- PMDP 2022 Accomplishments:
 - Mission #1: July 1-30, 2022
 - 97,295 pounds of marine debris removed
 - 86,350 pounds of nets from reefs
 - 313 nets from Kamokukamohoali‘i (Maro Reef)
 - 6,425 pounds of nets from shorelines
 - 4,520 pounds of plastic from shorelines
 - 1,100 acres of coral reef area cleaned and restored
 - Mission #2: September 15 – October 13, 2022
 - 105,655 pounds of marine debris removed
 - 64,000 pounds of nets from reefs
 - 226 nets from Manawai (Pearl and Hermes Atoll)
 - 35 nets from Hōlanikū (Kure Atoll)
 - 32,530 pounds of nets from shorelines
 - 9,125 pounds of plastic from shorelines
 - 1,600 acres of coral reef area cleaned and restored
- PMDP Accomplishments
2022 TOTALS
 - 202,950 pounds (101 tons) of marine debris removed – 189,305 pounds of nets
 - 150,350 pounds of nets from reefs
 - 574 nets
 - 38,955 pounds of nets from shorelines
 - 13,645 pounds of plastics from shorelines
 - 2,700 acres of coral reef area cleaned and restored
 - 2020 – Present: 503,747 pounds (251 tons) of marine debris removed from Papahānaumokuākea
- Catch-up and Keep-up: A Strategy for Marine Debris Mitigation in Papahānaumokuākea
 - ‘Catch-up’ with the backlog of marine debris 2006-2020
 - ‘Keep-up’ with the annual accumulation entering Papahānaumokuākea (57 TONS per YEAR- *Dameron et al. 2006*)
 - ****Only In-Water Ghost Nets****
- Roadmap
 - 2023: 2x 30-day In-Water Removal Missions
 - Goal: 114 tons in-water removed

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- 2024 – 2027: 2x 30-day In-Water Removal Missions, 1x 30-day Shoreline Mission
 - Goal: 114 tons in-water, 57 tons shoreline
- 2028 – Beyond: Reef Maintenance Mode, increased focus on shoreline debris
- INNOVATION to increase efficiency
- Debris Removal Efficiency Bottlenecks
 - Locating marine debris
 - Cutting marine debris into manageable pieces
 - Lifting marine debris into small boats for transport
- Innovation to Shorten the “Catch Up” Timeline
 - Continue developing unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs or drones) to detect large floating marine debris or debris ‘hot-spots’
 - Propose diver propulsion vehicles (DPVs or dive scooters) to expedite swim surveys to locate marine debris
 - Develop new, innovative tools to expedite the process of cutting marine debris into manageable pieces
 - Develop new, innovative apparatuses and technologies to expedite the process of lifting marine debris into small boats
- Questions:
 - Sam Gon: What steps are being taken to reduce the source of marine debris, to reduce the yearly accumulation rate?
 - Mark Hixon: Any efforts to identify the sources and impose fines?
 - James: At NOAA Fisheries, we've collected about 25 years of data to try and identify fisheries and countries with a heavy effort to measure mesh size and manufacture. We are using that to try to identify sources.
 - It is mostly trawl or purse seine fishing nets with less than 1% of Hawai'i origin.
 - Linda Paul: Do you have any long term funding to keep going and from what source?
 - Dan: Efforts being funded by my department
 - James: National Fish and Wildlife Foundation, NOAA Marine Debris Bill and PMNM with half private funds and the other half, federal.

International Workshop on Indigenous Communities and Government Partnerships for Protected Area Management & Cross-Pacific Indigenous Exchange

(Kalani Quiocho and Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala)

- Kalani Quiocho and Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala both attended the International Workshop on Indigenous Communities and Government Partnerships for Protected Area Management & Cross-Pacific Indigenous Exchange. They came away with meaningful conversations based on trust, respect, and understanding and ideas and engagement for Hawai'i and others.
- Background
 - International Workshop (9-12 Sept. 2022)
 - Broaden US- Chile protected area partnership
 - Engage Indigenous communities of the U.S. and Chile (and Canada and

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- Mexico)
 - Focus on Collaborative Management (w/ governments)
 - Facilitated a dialogue among Indigenous representatives associated with protected areas
 - For agencies - an opportunity to support, listen, and learn
 - Cross-Pacific Exchange (13-15 Sept. 2022)
 - Existing and emerging ONMS Indigenous partners across the Pacific
 - Discussion of shared interest among key tribal and Indigenous partners and facilitate a cultural exchange to strengthen and sustain cross-Pacific Indigenous relationships.
 - Identify actionable items for ONMS to support relationship building with indigenous partners.
- Learning
 - Protected Area dialogues must address broader social, cultural and economic contexts
 - Ethical Space
 - Structures for Consensus
 - Decision-making
 - Supporting Indigenous Capacity
- Working Together in the Sanctuary System
 - The workshop was equally powerful and was led by the Makah Tribe as hosts and focused on national marine sanctuaries. The agenda co-developed with the Makah Tribe, with direction from the full tribal council. We had a subset of the Port Angeles attendees, as well as a few new attendees, and again we were focused on communities with existing and emerging relationships with ONMS across the Pacific. The meeting was structured around large group discussions, cultural sharing and exchanges, actively engaging with each other outside (chartered boat trip, hiking, beach walks, etc.), and sharing food. A key part of this success, again, is about taking the time and working together – being good partners, and taking direction from our Partners, respecting that we are on their homelands.
- Take Aways - Neah Bay Workshop
 - Did have virtual engagement with NMSAS for one of the afternoon sessions, as they were originally planning to have 1-2 representatives attend, but given conflicting events were unable to make this exchange.
 - Focus on relationship building and building trust
 - Importance of flexibility - tribes and communities are different
 - Respect for tribal governments and treaty rights, including engaging at appropriate levels
 - Including Indigenous Peoples with all recognition status
 - Agencies need to build capacity to work with indigenous communities, including interagency coordination and commitment continuity (e.g. in documents, principles), as well as support indigenous capacity building to engage appropriately with the agency.
- ONMS Commitments - Neah Bay Workshop (1)
 - Convene ONMS/Indigenous Partners Group in future (Requested: meeting in

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- FY23; Pacific-wide focus)
- Establish standard operating procedures on tribal/indigenous engagement (broad guidance with flexibility to adapt at sites).
- Continue to explore collaborative management (as a continuum of approaches with flexibility and adaptation over time)
- Include our approach to collaborative management in sanctuary management plans
- **ONMS Commitments - Neah Bay Workshop (2)**
 - Advocate for strengthening tribal/Indigenous roles within reauthorization of NMSA, NOAA Organic Act
 - Increase capacity within ONMS (plan to establish cultural resource coordinator positions for West Coast and Eastern Regions)
 - Strengthen internal NOAA coordination
 - Support cultural and language conservation and revitalization (e.g. use of Indigenous languages in outreach, place names, etc.)
- **This is Just the Beginning**
 - Explore follow up workshop and exchange platform (possible State Dept support)
 - Continue the dialogue at IMPAC5 and leaders forum
 - Potential additional international partners and engagement
 - Explore building an international platform to support Indigenous exchange
- **No matter where they're from, all indigenous people share the same values even through the language barrier. There was a very strong and very clear way to collaborate amongst these people. (Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala)**
 - There was a lot to learn throughout our agencies in Hawai'i. It was valuable to have OHA there as a co trustee - to have a clear role within our monument and moving forward with our sanctuaries.
 - While we are different countries or areas, what came through was that these lines and boundaries don't mean anything for natural resources protection, it's all our responsibility.

Planning, Evaluation, and Sanctuary Designation Subcommittee Presentation (Linda Paul)

- Linda Paul presented the non fishing regulation recommendations drafted for the original monument and Monument Expansion Area (MEA) waters by the RAC's Planning, Evaluation, and Sanctuary Designation (PES) subcommittee, after thorough analysis of monument regulations, executive orders and presidential proclamations, and other documents. These recommendations are mainly focused on aligning regulations across the two monument areas to the extent possible, and ensuring that the sanctuary regulations provide protections to the MEA that are equal or greater than current regulations for the original monument boundary.
- **Base Assumptions**
 - Sanctuary regulations will apply to marine waters only.
 - Sanctuary regulations will mirror and complement existing monument regulations, providing durability.
 - Since all current proclamation and regulatory requirements are not applicable everywhere, zones or areas of the sanctuary may have slight differences.

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- **General Recommendations**
 - Original Monument Waters: The sanctuary regulations should mirror existing regulations (50 CFR 404) to the extent possible.
 - Expansion Area Waters (MEA): New regulations need to be developed for the expansion area zone based on preexisting presidential proclamations and 50 CFR 404.
 - To the extent possible, regulations for the original monument and MEA should be in alignment, while ensuring that regulations provide the same or greater protection to MEA resources as original monument regulations.
- **Specific Recommendations**
 - Prohibitions
 - The RAC proposes including language in the sanctuary regulations to supplement an existing 50 CFR 404 prohibition on ‘Exploring for, developing, or producing oil, gas, or minerals.’
 - The proposed prohibition language for the new regulations is as follows:
 - “Exploring for, developing, extracting, processing or producing oil, gas or minerals within the sanctuary.”
 - Permit Categories
 - The existing permit categories from the original monument should be applied to the MEA, except for the Special Ocean Use (SOU) and Recreation permit categories. Neither of these categories is included as a regulated activity in Presidential Proclamation 9478. Additionally, public perception may be that SOU weakens protections in the MEA.
 - Findings Criteria for Permits
 - To the extent possible, the regulations should employ common findings criteria across all areas and waters of the sanctuary.
 - *Note: Findings criteria are a list of defined criteria in the regulations that must be met by all permit applicants, ensuring that their proposed activities are consistent with Proclamation 8031 and the goals of the monument. Findings are used in decision making as a basis for approving or denying a permit request.*
 - Vessel Monitoring System (VMS) Requirements
 - The regulations should incorporate a VMS requirement for permitted vessels in the MEA, updating the content found in current monument regulations to reflect current technology.
- **Addendum Regarding Fishing Recommendations**
 - The RAC has also made clarifications to one of the fishing regulations recommendations made in our previous letter of September 8, 2022. The revised recommendation is as follows:
 - The RAC has provided ONMS and WPRFMC with a recommendation that non-commercial fishing in the MEA be limited to sustenance fishing, which Proclamation 8031 defined as “fishing for bottomfish or pelagic species that are consumed within the Monument, and that is incidental to an activity permitted.”

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- The PESS recommends additional language defining non-commercial fishing in the MEA as follows:
- Any resource harvested in the MEA during sustenance fishing:
 - must be a sustainably managed resource;
 - must be consumed or utilized within the MEA;
 - either in whole or in part, may not enter commerce through sale, barter or trade; and
 - must be harvested incidental to a permitted activity.

RAC Discussions (Ailā)

- Kupuna Council Working Group (Rick Gaffney)
 - Rick proposed a new Kupuna Council Working Group for the RAC, as an extended presence of kupuna who have been involved with **PMNM** from the earliest days.
 - The working group would serve to provide some oversight and bring institutional knowledge to the RAC
 - There is over 20 years of involvement from some of the founding members.
- Comments:
 - OHA supports the idea of a working group to maintain historical context and continuity. (Kealoha Piscotti)
 - Judith Cucco thinks its a great idea.

Public Comment (Ailā)

There were no pre-registered public comments. Chair Ailā called for public comments on the call and one individual requested to give verbal comments.

- Tammy Harp wished everyone aloha. She was really glad to see the milestones that PMNM has achieved and was impressed with the presentations. PMNM is heading in the right direction and it's good to hear other native people are part of the United States and that we are not alone. She liked the Kupuna WG idea but encouraged the RAC to keep it small, maybe just include the past RAC members. Tammy also:
 - Wished Chair William Ailā to stay on the RAC, now that we are positively moving on.
 - Encouraged everyone to keep up the good work. It's okay to disagree. Mahalo to everyone for your time and NWHI.
 - Proposed we eliminate the word "subsistence" from our language in terms of marine policy. That way we have no confusion.

Wrap Up, Decisions (Ailā)

- PES subcommittee recommendations on non-fishing regulations
 - Chair Ailā called for a motion to approve the PESS non fishing regulation recommendations and to share them with ONMS Director John Armor through the acting superintendent.
 - Judith Cucco motioned to approve the recommendations. Sam Gon seconded the motion.
- Kupuna Council Working Group

Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

- Chair Ailā called for a motion to convene a Kupuna Council Working Group with all interested members before the next meeting.
 - Sam Gon motioned to convene the working group. Judith Cucco seconded the motion.
- Chair, Vice-Chair, Secretary Election (member poll)
 - Chair Ailā called on PMNM staff to start the election for Advisory Council officer positions. Staff only received nominations for the Chair and Vice Chair positions, and not the Secretary position. Council members voted virtually through the Google Meet polling feature.
 - Linda Paul received a simple majority and was elected Chair.
 - Rick Gaffney received a simple majority and was elected Vice Chair.

RAC Meeting Planning (Ailā)

The Council discussed potential meeting dates and formats for the new year, 2023. PMNM staff launched a Google Meet poll to gauge in-person meeting interest. RAC members asked for virtual meetings in the new year with plans to revisit the format and consider in-person collaboration, pending COVID-19 protocol. The Council agreed on the following meeting date(s) for 2023:

- January 18th (VIRTUAL)
- April 19th
- July 19-20th (two day meeting) [NMS designation workshop]
- October 18th